GHOST DANCE SONGS AND RELIGION
OF A WIND RIVER SHOSHONE WOMAN

Judith Vander
GHOST DANCE SONGS AND RELIGION
OF A WIND RIVER SHOSHONE WOMAN

Judith Vander

MONOGRAPH SERIES IN ETHNOMUSICOLOGY, NUMBER 4

Managing Editor:
Roger Wright

Editorial Assistant:
Bret Werb

Publications Committee:
Sue Carole De Vale
Nazir Ali Jairazbhoy, Chair
James Porter (ex-officio,
Chair, Division of Ethnomusicology)

Program in Ethnomusicology
Department of Music
University of California, Los Angeles

1986
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface 1

Introduction 3

Wind River Shoshone History
Biographical Sketch of Emily Hill

The Naraya 7

Emily Hill's Account of Naraya Practice and Meaning
Naraya Origins and the 1890 Ghost Dance

Musical Analysis 15

Inexact Repetition
Unequal Pairing or Balancing
Flow and Flux in Naraya Song Form
Plains Influence on the Naraya Songs

Textual Analysis 37

Nature Texts
Texts Concerning Life of the Soul
The Relationship of Naraya Texts to other Ghost Dance Texts

The Naraya Today 63

Relationship to Contemporary Wind River Shoshone Ceremonies
Naraya Decline
Emily Hill's Naraya Faith

Appendix 71

Ghost Dance Recordings and Published Musical Transcriptions

References Cited 73

Song Transcriptions

Inside Back
Cover
PREFACE

The Ghost Dance songs and beliefs of one elderly woman, Emily Hill, express personal religious faith and in a broader context reveal Wind River Shoshone interpretation of the Ghost Dance religion. In this monograph I will use 17 Shoshone Ghost Dance songs as a focus, analyzing music and text in order to define musical and poetic style. Beyond poetic style, song texts provide insights into Shoshone Ghost Dance concerns and beliefs. Although Wind River Shoshone were active participants in Plains culture, their Ghost Dance beliefs and song texts suggest an erosion of Plains influence and a closer relationship to Great Basin culture, cradle of the Ghost Dance religion and Shoshone culture itself. In more recent times one sees a parallel erosion of Plains influence on other Shoshone ceremonies as well.

My introduction to Ghost Dance songs began in the summer of 1977 when I first met Emily Hill and Dorothy Tappay, her half-sister, with whom she lived until Dorothy's death in 1982. At that time I was studying Wind River Shoshone ceremonial music and although I worked primarily with male singers, traditional singers of that repertoire, I also became acquainted with several women who were active singers. Upon completing my project on ceremonial music in 1978, I began a new project on the music of five Shoshone women. Fieldwork during the summers of 1979 to 1982 focused on women and during this time my friendship and work with Emily deepened.

After several summers of fieldwork it became apparent to me that Emily's knowledge of Ghost Dance songs outstripped that of all the other singers that I knew on the reservation. Some older singers can sing three or four Ghost Dance songs. Although at one time they might have known many more, through lack of hearing and singing, these songs are now mostly forgotten. Emily's 17 Ghost Dance songs are also unique within the body of available recordings and published transcriptions of Ghost Dance songs; they are the largest number of songs from one singer. Mooney, the most important collector of Ghost Dance songs, rarely identifies the singer, simply classifying the songs according to tribe. Curtis and
Densmore collected as many as four songs from an individual singer. Similarly, there are only three or four Ghost Dance songs on individual recordings and in some cases the singer remains unidentified. (See Appendix, pp. 71-72.)

When my work with Emily was drawing to a close in 1982, she could no longer sing. Then, unexpectedly, she allowed me to make copies of tapes of Ghost Dance song performances which she and Dorothy had made over the years. Thus, I received an additional 130 Ghost Dance songs after the completion of this manuscript. Although extensive work remains to be done on these 130 songs, preliminary analysis of both the music and the text suggests corroboration of my interpretation in the present publication.

Because of Dorothy’s illness I have always worked primarily with Emily. But as regards Ghost Dance songs, the two women sang and shared the same repertoire. Often they would sing together for me, but sometimes one or the other would choose to sing a song by herself. Songs 4, 13, and 15 were solo performances by Dorothy but, as the reader will see, Emily’s comments and explanations of these song texts clearly reveal her knowledge of them as well.

It is my hope that this work pays honor to Emily Hill, the songs and religious faith which are so meaningful to her. I thank Emily for the many hours which she has spent with me translating song texts, and also the late Rupert Weeks and Gladys Hill for their invaluable assistance. Within the scholarly community I thank Demetri Shimkin for sending on to me all pertinent information from his 1937 fieldnotes, his linguistic assistance, careful review of this monograph, and unfailing support throughout the years of my research. I also gratefully acknowledge the linguistic assistance of Richley Crapo. Finally, this work was made possible through the assistance of a research grant from the National Endowment for the Humanities. While I thank all those who made this publication possible, I alone take full responsibility for any of its errors of fact or interpretation.
INTRODUCTION

Wind River Shoshone History

Linguistic evidence points to Shoshone origins in the southwestern portion of the Great Basin near Death Valley (Johnson 1975:16-18). The pre-horse Shoshones foraged for their daily diet, supplementing this with hunting and fishing when available. The search for food was a primary concern reflected in the names which Shoshones used to distinguish one group from another according to diet — Mountain Sheep Eaters, Salmon Eaters, Pine Nut Eaters, etc. (Hoebel 1938:410-412). This particular concern and focus of Great Basin culture forms an important substratum of Wind River Shoshone culture. We will see the continued importance of these elements expressed in the Shoshone interpretation of the Ghost Dance.

By 1500 some of the Shoshones had crossed the Rocky Mountains and entered the Plains (Trenholm 1964:17). In the early eighteenth century they were one of the first groups to acquire the horse on the northern Plains (Shimkin, in press). Mounted, the Shoshones successfully hunted the herds of bison which migrated across the Plains; bison became the new dietary staple. Movement onto the Plains for hunting grounds brought both contact and conflict between the different tribes. Prowess in hunting, warfare, and horse stealing became the yardsticks for prestige and status. However, nineteenth-century Plains culture bloomed briefly. The European man who brought the horse and the gun also brought his family and his culture, crossing the indigenous game paths and culture patterns in complex and ultimately destructive ways. Chief Washakie, who gained prominence in the middle part of the nineteenth century, foresaw the inevitable decline of hunting grounds and bison herds and concluded that accommodation and friendly relations with the Euro-Americans were the best strategies for Shoshone survival. In 1868, Washakie signed a treaty with the United States government which established the Wind River Reservation in west-central Wyoming, a fragment of previous Shoshone territory, for his band of Shoshones and others who subsequently joined him. This treaty also included provisions for farm
equipment and seeds, the beginnings of the more recent cultural stratum of settled reservation life.

The period from 1885 to 1905 was a cruel time for the Shoshones, a time of privation, sickness, and traumatic change. The buffalo were gone, the government placed the Northern Arapaho — traditional enemy of the Shoshone — on the reservation, government rations were lowered, agricultural attempts which had at first flourished subsequently failed, and a measles epidemic brought death to many Shoshone children (Shimkin 1942:454, 455). Emily’s parents lived through this time.

As the old ways and beliefs crumbled, Shoshones looked for new values and traditions. Some were influenced by the Mormon proselytizing, others were receptive to the teaching of an Episcopalian missionary, Reverend John Roberts. As a result of his longstanding efforts, most Shoshones, including Emily, are at least nominal Episcopalians. Shoshones sought contacts with a variety of other tribes, including the Crow, Comanche, Gros Ventre, and Cree. New religions, such as the Ghost Dance and Peyote religions, and new dances, the Women’s Dance and Wolf Dance, grew out of these intertribal contacts. The old Sun Dance was renewed, combining old beliefs, Christian symbolism, and addressing the grave problems of health and tribal disunity which marked the times. Beliefs forged in the heat of that painful time of cultural flux and physical hardship soon crystallized and cooled. They form the mold for Shoshone beliefs in the twentieth century. In 1942 Shimkin noted, “The excessive concern with illness in all the modern institutions: Sun Dance, Peyote Cult, Wolf Dance and Ghost Dance grew out of this, I believe” (Shimkin 1942:460). Livelihood today comes from a variety of farming, ranching, leasing, and employment on and off the reservation, all supplemented by the per capita allotment of tribal income derived from oil and gas royalties.

**Biographical Sketch of Emily Hill**

Emily has spent her entire life on the Wind River Reservation in Wyoming. Born in 1911, she attended a government boarding school on the reservation from the time she was six until she was eighteen. She married when she was twenty, had three children, and subsequently divorced her husband — never remarrying. Today, only one of Emily’s sisters and brothers remains from a family of nine children; all of her own children are also dead. Her seven grown grandchildren as well as her eight great-grandchildren visit her.

Emily lived most of her adult life with one of her sisters who was an invalid for many years. Before her sister, Dorothy, became confined to bed, Emily remembers the two of them taming horse teams and going up the mountain in a wagon before daybreak to fell and haul down the big timber — this before there were any roads. The two women put in fields of hay, harvesting them with the buck rake and stacker. At home Emily churned butter and tanned hides.

From their mother, both Emily and Dorothy learned the love of singing along with many of their mother’s songs. She also taught them to garden, and each
spring Emily puts up tomatoes, corn, carrots, turnips, rutabaga, squash, cucumbers, and watermelons. Emily also has a rich knowledge of wild food that grows on the reservation.

Emily's parents took her to her first performance of the Ghost Dance in 1921 when she was ten years old. She attended Ghost Dance performances until she was in her twenties, when the religion began to fade. The Ghost Dance songs and beliefs acquired during the early part of Emily's life endure to the present and form the core of this paper.

There are two final points to be made about Emily's life. First, Emily has a sense of her own cultural history and background. Although outsiders consider the Wind River Shoshones a unified band of Shoshones who clustered around their last powerful chief, Chief Washakie, Shoshones remember the different, smaller bands which coalesced to form Washakie's band. Emily mentions three bands: Gwitchiindikâ (Buffalo Eaters), Doliyai (Mountain People) who eat wild game, and Hukudika (Dirt or Root Eaters). Emily's mother was a Doliyai or Mountain Person and, according to Emily, Mountain People were very clean. Emily's Father, who died when she was a toddler, and her step-father were both Root-Eaters. Root-Eaters were said to like good times and dances. Emily notes these influences on her character. The use, appreciation, and knowledge of wild game, wild edible plants, and songs and dances are important aspects of her life.

Emily is a medicine woman. Over the years people have heard of her abilities to cure and have come to her home for help. She learned this ability by herself: "It's just my ways." Knowledge of plants and their medicinal use comes to Emily in dreams. In addition to plants, she uses combinations of prayers, touching, and blood-letting as part of her healing practices.

To my knowledge Emily is the only Shoshone today who maintains belief in the Ghost Dance religion. Although Emily herself uses the English term, Ghost Dance, she feels that it is incorrect and offensive. Talking about the music she simply states that the songs are sacred prayer songs. The Wind River Shoshone name for the religion, Naraya, refers to the shuffling step of the dance. Henceforth, I shall refer to the Shoshone Ghost Dance by its Shoshone name, Naraya, and the religion as practiced by all other tribes as the Ghost Dance.
THE NARAYA

Emily Hill’s Account of Naraya Practice and Meaning

With this understanding of who Emily Hill is and some of the cultural forces which have shaped her, let us listen to her remembrances of the Naraya and to its meaning which, for her, remains vital and undiminished.

You hear White people down different states some place way down east or someplace—they got measles, they got flu, they got some kind of a disease. One of the old Indians, he sleep and then dream about it. That kind of flu or measles or some kind of a sickness that’s some kind of cough. Just like air, it’s coming, coming this way. Let’s dance! We just make it go back.

Only certain old men received this kind of dream as well as Naraya songs. Announcers used to tell the people when a dance was coming up.

When we going to really have a dance, they going to go four nights. You have a feast. They start in the evening when it kind of gets dark. They got a song, I don’t remember that song, they march around. There’s a song that’s going to start off. Walk around and then stop. . . . When they dance they stand after they stop, they go like this. . . .

Emily patted her body and then blew across the palm of her hand. That gesture as well as the shaking out of blankets signified the blowing and shaking away of illness. Emily added that people also stamped the ground after a dance so that the roots that people used to eat would grow. Emily continues her description:

When you’re dancing with a man you’d hold hands, but when you’re dancing with a woman—men [dancing with men]—they don’t hold hands. The one that sings, that leader . . . some of them would join in, help sing. Them songs been sung long time ago, by old Indians, I don’t know how many hundred years. The people that we never seen. . . . When they’re
going to quit too, they got a song for that. I don't remember them things. I
know them but I can't remember them. They dance then maybe 'til
midnight. Quit. After they dance they're going to eat something. . . .
When they're going to quit [the entire series of dances] they dance in the
daytime.

People gathered in clearings close to the rivers which cut through the reservation —
North Fork (where Emily lives), Trout Creek, and Sage Creek. The dance was
done in a circle, lit only by a campfire and the stars. Women wore shawls or
blankets and some men wore blankets. Since the Shoshone word Naraya, simply
means shuffling or dragging the foot, it was also used in the past to refer to a
similar dance, the Women's Dance (predecessor of today's Round Dance). The
music for the dance was ever-changing, and many songs would be sung over the
course of an evening's dance. Because of an old enmity, Arapahoes who shared
the reservation did not join the Shoshone in their performances of the Naraya.

One elderly Shoshone man also recalls that after a song finished, people
shook their legs, pounding them on the ground. He offered this interpretation:
"They try to wake the dead ones underneath the ground. It's what they want to
come."

Emily's other sister, Millie, along with Millie's son, husband, and
husband's relatives, made a colored-pencil drawing in 1960 of a 1924 Shoshone
Naraya, a representation which suggests various social aspects of the dance. Millie
points out that some of the dancers in the picture are giving and receiving amorous
glances. Other dancers who notice this respond with anger and disapproval, as they
want everyone to concentrate on the serious religious purpose of the dance. Some
of the men in the picture wear tall reservation hats and pants with beaded cuffs.
Women wear high-top moccasins, some covering their heads with silk kerchiefs
which used to be imported from eastern Europe. Others, who are bare-headed,
color the part in their hair with red Indian paint. A few drunkards and onlookers,
including women with babies strapped to their backs, fill out the peripheral social
scene.

Emily states and restates the meaning of the dance, its purposeful work:

It's something like somebody knows something: measles or fever or some
kind of disease coming. Flu or measles or scarlet fever. . . . One person
knows when he's asleep. He knows that it's coming. It's coming like a
ball of those bees. He can see them at nights asleep. That bad stuff's
coming to us. We better be dancing . . . sending it back, and it away.
That's the way they dance it. It isn't just a dance. . . . It's the same way
with Sun Dance. With the leader that's going to give the Sun Dance. He's
going to dream that he's giving that dance, so everybody can live out the
winter good. The children should grow up good. That's the way they
dream things like that.

Song and dance enter the circle of cause and effect becoming a force within
the natural world. The Naraya serves as a potent force within the natural world.
The Naraya prevented harm and at the same time played a role in the renewal of nature.

When you sing that song, when you dance, Mother Nature's going to give all the berries. They're going to grow good. And water too. There's... songs about storms too and other things like that. We always sing those Ghost Dance songs. Our place looks real good. That's what it means — it makes seeds grow... I heard the Nevada people have that dance all the time. They say, 'Well, let's dance. Let's get... our grass and our berries to grow. We'll sing for that.' You know Johnny Dick [a Naraya leader on the Wind River Reservation when Emily was young], he's from Nevada. He's got songs like that... He tells people, 'Well, let's dance. Let's get 'em alive. Get the grass and trees alive.'

In addition to the two main purposes and functions of the Naraya — prevention of sickness and other natural disasters and revitalization of life itself — a third function, curing of disease, is briefly mentioned by Emily. "Well, it's a song for health. When you don't feel good you dance with them. You feel good then. That's what it's for."

**Naraya Origins and the 1890 Ghost Dance**

The Ghost Dance religion of 1890 had its origins with Wovoka, a Paiute prophet who lived in Mason Valley, Nevada, close to the Walker Lake Reservation. In the late 1880's, Wovoka, or Jack Wilson as he was known in the non-Indian world, fell ill with a severe fever which happened to coincide with a solar eclipse. In a feverish state he received a vision:

When the sun died, I went up to heaven and saw God and all the people who had died a long time ago. God told me to come back and tell my people they must be good and love one another, and not fight, or steal, or lie. He gave me this dance, to give to my people. (Mooney 1965:2)

The beliefs and practices of the religion were subsequently written down as Wovoka spoke to a visiting delegation of Southern Arapahoes and Cheyennes. The following letter is Mooney's free rendering of this message.

When you get home you must make a dance to continue five days. Dance four successive nights, and the last night keep up the dance until the morning of the fifth day, when all must bathe in the river and then disperse to their homes. You must all do in the same way.

I, Jack Wilson, love you all, and my heart is full of gladness for the gifts you have brought me. When you get home I shall give you a good cloud [rain?] which will make you feel good. I give you a good spirit and
give you all good paint. I want you to come again in three months, some from each tribe there [the Indian Territory].

There will be a good deal of snow this year and some rain. In the fall there will be such a rain as I have never given you before.

Grandfather [a universal title of reverence among Indians and here meaning the messiah] says, when your friends die you must not cry. You must not hurt anybody or do harm to anyone. You must not fight. Do right always. It will give you satisfaction in life. This young man has a good father and mother. [Possibly this refers to Casper Edson, the young Arapaho who wrote down this message of Wovoka for the delegation].

Do not tell the white people about this. Jesus is now upon the earth. He appears like a cloud. The dead are all alive again. I do not know when they will be here; maybe this fall or in the spring. When the time comes there will be no more sickness and everyone will be young again.

Do not refuse to work for the whites and do not make trouble with them until you leave them. When the earth shakes [at the coming of the new world] do not be afraid. It will not hurt you.

I want you to dance every six weeks. Make a feast at the dance and have food that everybody may eat. Then bathe in the water. That is all. You will receive good words again from me some time. Do not tell lies.

(Mooney 1965:23)

Mooney (1965:46) writes, "The first Ghost Dance on Walker Lake Reservation took place in January, 1889." Word of the new religion spread quickly. The Bannock, neighbors to the north whose language is close to Paiute, were among the first to hear and to send delegates to dance in Nevada. Mooney singled out the Bannock and Shoshone of Ft. Hall Reservation as the main communication link between the western and Plains tribes, noting the frequent visits between the Ft. Hall and Wind River reservations. A Bannock who visited the Wind River Reservation early in 1889 brought news of the religion. As a consequence, five Wind River Shoshones traveled by train to Mason Valley to visit Wovoka in the summer of 1889 and, upon their return, Shoshones danced the Naraya (Mooney 1965:51, 52). In 1890 Moses Tassissie, prominent Shoshone leader of the time, likewise visited Wovoka (Shimkin 1942:457).

From Mooney's 1892-93 report we learn that Shoshones usually performed the Naraya in the morning, dancing around a small cedar tree planted in the ground. Paradoxically, Mooney reports Shoshone loss of faith in the Naraya in 1892 when he visited the Wind River reservation and yet, inexplicably, a Naraya performance took place during this same visit. A Shoshone interpreter told Mooney during that visit, "Yes, they are dancing the Ghost Dance. That's something I have never reported, and I never will. It is their religion and they have a right to it." (Mooney 1965: 53) We shall return to the Ghost Dance movement and the eventual decline of the Naraya after a close examination of Naraya music and texts which yields some clues.

The historical background of the Naraya is complex. Emily states,
That Ghost Dance, it belongs here.... It's been going on all them years.... People long time ago, they dance it. When they died, the rest dance. It's been going on that way.... It ain't just started a few years ago.... It's been put here on this world for the Indians long time ago.... I don't know how many hundred years ago.

Although Emily expresses no recognition or knowledge of Wovoka, she retells a Shoshone parallel to Wovoka's seminal religious experience. A Shoshone man who would have been a contemporary of Emily's grandfather, told the Shoshones to dance the Naraya. He lay on the ground, seemingly dead, as the Naraya dancers danced around him in a circle. After the dance he came back to life and thereafter lived a long healthy life.

Even in the late nineteenth century Mooney reported that Shoshones considered the Naraya to be but a "revival of a similar dance which existed among them fifty years ago." (Mooney 1965:53) Spier traces sources of the 1890 Ghost Dance to an aboriginal complex of dance and doctrine which arose in the interior Plateau area of the northwest, dating back to at least the beginning of the nineteenth century. This and its later Christianized version, around 1830, formed the matrix for the 1890 Ghost Dance (Spier 1935:5, 24). It is possible to draw connecting lines of contact between the Wind River Shoshone and this earlier so-called "Prophet Dance" complex. Early writings of the 1830's record the practice of the Christianized version of the Prophet Dance by the Flathead and Nez Perce. Spier writes,

> It is important to note that the locale of the Flathead and Nez Perce rites described by Wyeth and Bonneville was the upper Snake River country. At this period (1830-40) these tribes and their neighbors were accustomed to go there annually to hunt buffalo, and their relations with the Shoshoneans of the region were on the whole friendly. This means that doctrine and dance were well within reach of the northern Shoshonean peoples. (Spier 1935: 21)

Wind River Shoshone contact and exchange with both the Northern Shoshone and Flathead at that time were well established (Shimkin 1942:451). Chief Washakie, himself part Flathead, epitomized the alliances which grew from such close inter-tribal connections.

In 1937, Shimkin received information about the Father Dance, the Wind River Shoshone precursor of the Naraya. According to Polly Shoyo, a Shoshone woman who was born ca. 1845, the Father Dance was held in the spring, three or four days after the leader or sponsor of the dance had a dream which prompted the occasion. The dance might be held to stop a smallpox epidemic or other illness. The sponsor and two assistants cut big-leaved sage and wrapped them into bundles. A circle of men and women in alternating positions held a sage bundle in each hand, hopping up and down. The sponsor, with sage tied around his head and wearing red paint, stood in the center and prayed. The performance of ten prayers and ten prayer-songs which had come to the sponsor in his dream
prevented the children from contracting illness. The dance began in the morning with a song followed by a prayer to the sun, moon, trees, queerly-shaped rocks, mountains, berries, sage, sky, water, and ground. Only adults participated in the Father Dance, repeating the special songs many times as they danced until evening. No one fainted. The dance simply ended and people went home. Polly distinguished the Father Dance, a dance performed by all the different Shoshone bands, from the Naraya, which she listed as one of the special dances of the Mountain Sheep Eaters (Dukurka) (Shimkin 1937:n.p.).

Interesting additions to Polly Shoyo’s description come from her contemporary, Moses Tassitsie. His second-hand account included the shaking of blankets and buffalo hides at the conclusion of the dance and some detail of the dance step — bending the knees and then slowly straightening them (Shimkin 1937:n.p.). Perhaps one can find an explanation for the name, Father Dance, in Tassitsie’s discussion of the Sun Dance. “In those [former] days we only knew the name ‘Our Father,’ to whom we prayed, but since then we have learned His Name from the white people — God.” (Shimkin 1942:458) Emily Hill explains the reference to “Our Father” in her songs as meaning the Creator (see songs 8, 9 pp. 46, 56). The Comanches, southern Shoshone relatives in Oklahoma, called the 1890 Ghost Dance, A’p-Anē ka’ra, the Father’s Dance (Mooney 1965:283).

Lowie received an explanation for the name, Father Dance, during his fieldwork on the Wind River Reservation in 1912. Note in this explanation the identification or confluence of Father Dance and Naraya (spelled Naraya) as well as the identification of coyote as the Creator and Father.

After the Father (āpō) had created the world, there was a man with his wife and two children. Coyote came along and said, ‘I am your father and made all these hills and trees. Now I will give you this āpō nōqā.’ [āpō, father, nōqā, dance] So he taught them the nā’rōya dance. Coyote was merely fooling the people. (Lowie 1915:817)

Lowie (1915:817) writes, “The Shoshone believe it always keeps storming when the dance is performed; thus last winter [1911, the year of Emily Hill’s birth] it was snowing all the time because of several performances.” Lowie’s description of the dance itself and its power to prevent and cure illness and affect the weather are substantially the same as Emily’s.

One can follow the fading distinction between the Father Dance and the Naraya in the remembrances of the Shoshone people that Shimkin spoke to in 1937. Polly Shoyo, born ca. 1845, saw and distinguished the Father Dance from the Naraya. Moses Tassitsie, born 1852, could only give a second-hand account of the Father Dance. However, the boundaries blur as he also said it was the same as the Naraya or Round Dance, and that the Naraya originated in Nevada. Charlie Washakie, son of Chief Washakie and born in 1873, said that the Father Dance was the same as the Naraya which Shoshones got from the Bannocks. Toorey Roberts, born in 1881, one of the leaders of the Naraya in the mid 1930’s, knew nothing of the Father Dance.
One final point remains to be made concerning Naraya origins, one which connects Wind River Shoshone accounts of the older Father Dance with Spier's discussion of an antecedent Prophet Dance. According to both Shoyo and Tassitsee's description of the Father Dance, the actual dance step differs significantly from that of the Naraya and the Ghost Dance performed by other tribes. Shoyo describes people hopping up and down; Tassitsee refines this description, adding that dancers bend the knees and then slowly straighten them. Spier (1935:20) regards the following 1833 description of a Flathead Prophet Dance as one prototype for the Christianized version of the dance (the dance-step resemblance between the Flathead dance and the Shoshone Father Dance is striking, suggestive evidence for cultural contact and historical depth): "In dancing they keep the feet in the same position the whole time merely jumping up to the tune keeping the hands in front of them..."

In contrast, the circle of Naraya dancers slowly revolves clockwise as each person moves one foot to the side and then pulls or drags the second foot in place beside it. Oldtimers today remember the smooth sideward motion and the click of the men's boot heels as the two feet came together. Spier (1935:12) presents three different choreographic prototypes of the Prophet Dance. The Father Dance followed one; the Naraya and Ghost Dance followed another: "...a circle of dancers with hands linked moving counterclockwise with shuffling step." Only the directional movement is at variance with Naraya and Ghost Dance performances. This particular dance step is the Shoshone name for the religion which Mooney (1965:35) reported as "Tānā' rāyūn or Tāmanā' rayāra...'everybody dragging,' an allusion to the manner in which the dancers move..." Naraya is the abbreviated name used today.

Shoshone Naraya belief and practice adhere closely to Ghost Dance religious tenets outlined by Wovoka. The actual dance form, schedule for performance (four nights ending on the morning of the fifth day), and inclusion of a feast are the same in both cases. Dream as a source of religious information, power, and authenticity is common to both, as is the intimate relationship of dance and ceremony to events in the natural world. Concern for life-sustaining water and relief from sickness are important in both religions. There are two points of difference. Emily never mentions the idea of eternal youth and only talks of the idea of return of the dead in connection with the story of the old Shoshone man and with one song.
MUSICAL ANALYSIS

A few general remarks serve as preface to a detailed analysis of 17 Naraya songs. All 17 songs are sung without any instrumental accompaniment, have Shoshone texts, and are very brief — taking less than a minute to complete one verse. Complete transcriptions of the 17 songs can be found in the booklet inside the back cover of this monograph. A song performance consists of several or many repetitions of the verse. Most of these songs are made of two repeated sections, the majority of which cadence on the tonic (see Table I, p. 16). Their undulating melodic contour moves within the melodic range of a fifth, principally on major seconds, minor thirds, and perfect fourths (see Table III, p. 24). Herzog’s (1935:403) analysis and description of Plains Ghost Dance songs casts a similar profile:

Comparison of all the Plains Ghost Dance melodies available to me (altogether thirty-eight) revealed in most of them a striking similarity amounting to a uniformity of style. The melodic range is usually narrow, essentially a fifth. As a rule there is no accompaniment. Many phrases end on the tonic. They fall into sections so symmetrical as to be startling in primitive material. This symmetry is achieved by the most essential feature of the style, a simple structural device: every phrase is rendered twice.

Herzog traced this Ghost Dance musical style to its Great Basin, Paiute origins. Repeated phrases, the essential structural feature of Ghost Dance songs and other Paiute music, had its analogue in Paiute speech as well. During his 1891 visit with Wovoka, Mooney (1965:13) noted,

...a peculiar conversational method of the Paiute. Each statement by the older man was repeated at its close, word by word and sentence by sentence, by the other, with the same monotonous inflection. This done, the first speaker signified by a grunt of approval that it had been correctly repeated, and then proceeded with the next statement, which was duly repeated in like manner.
Table I

Table I relates the Naraya songs to Herzog’s analytical table of Plains Ghost Dance songs (Herzog 1935:406). To facilitate comparison, I follow his procedure: roman numerals stand for tones below the tonic and arabic numerals for tones above it, starting with 1 on the tonic.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Range</th>
<th>Structure</th>
<th>Finals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>aab1b2</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>aabb</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>aabb</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>aab1b2</td>
<td>1, 1, VI, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>aabb</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6A</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>aabb</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6B</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>aab1b2</td>
<td>V, V, VII, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>aabb</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>ababcc</td>
<td>1, VII, 1, VII, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>abcxccx</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>a1a2b1b2</td>
<td>1, 1, 1 (VI?), VI (1?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11A, B</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>aabb</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>aab1b2</td>
<td>VI, VI, VI, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>aab1b2</td>
<td>2 (1?), 2 (1?), 1 (VII?), 1 (VII?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14A, B</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>a1a2b1b2</td>
<td>VI, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>abbc</td>
<td>VII, VII, 1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>a1a2b1b2</td>
<td>1, V, V, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>ab1b2</td>
<td>1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Herzog further demonstrated the endurance of Ghost Dance musical style even within the foreign, contrasting musical setting of the Plains. He backed up these statements with a table showing the range, form, and phrase finals of the 38 songs which he studied. Emily's Naraya songs conform to these findings.

In his overview of Plains Ghost Dance musical style, Herzog underscored its symmetry and simplicity. Certainly this is one truth concerning Emily's Naraya songs. And yet, as I became more and more familiar with Emily's songs I began to sense that there was another truth to their nature and essence, one that balanced this first truth in an opposing and yet complementary manner.

Herzog's analysis, based on a statistical study of selected musical parameters, focused on shared common traits. However, a second type of analysis, one which unselectively studies in detail the unique, idiosyncratic features of each song, brings into focus other characteristics. If one places the particular individualities of the 17 songs side by side, a different set of patterns emerges. In contrast to simplicity and symmetry one sees patterns of complexity and asymmetry. How do the two profiles interact and mesh? "Dynamic symmetry," a term coined by Witherspoon in a discussion of Navajo art, provides a helpful model for a creative approach which integrates the asymmetrical with the symmetrical into a coherent unified whole.

Just as perfect symmetry in art is basically static, perfect equality and balance between two parts of a pair also produces a static result. . . . Dynamic symmetry is based on the ideas of similar and complementary but inexact, imperfect, and unequal pairing or balancing. . . . Dynamic symmetry is more characteristic of the dynamic flow and flux found in nature and in the proportions of the human body and in the growing plant. (Witherspoon 1977:197-200)

The remainder of my musical analysis will expound on the integration of the asymmetrical — the inexact, imperfect, unequal pairing or balancing — within the symmetrical framework of paired, repeated patterns.

*Inexact Repetition*

Repetition is the most important characteristic of Emily's Naraya songs. Not only is there repetition of the phrases or progressions within the song, but the song itself repeats several times, both when Emily sang the songs for me and when sung during Naraya dances which she attended in the 1920s and 1930s. Repetition gives symmetry to these songs. At the same time, because the repetition is often "inexact, imperfect," casting up slightly variant forms of itself — it is dynamic and lively. The following fragment from Song 1 is typical of the tiny variants commonly found between repeated sections within a song.
Example 1. Excerpt of Song 1

Changes of this order crop up in the repetition of sections within the song proper, as above, and also abound between the repetitions of the entire song. The substitution of a neighboring scale tone, as in the above example, is the most common pitch variant used in these songs.

One encounters rhythmic variations of the same order. In the following fragments from Song 11B (the 1979 performance of Song 11), the substitution of ♩ for ♩ exemplifies a typical rhythmic variation.

Example 2. Excerpt of Song 11

The mathematical possibilities for combining these tiny variations of pitch and rhythm are legion. The b sections of the 1979 performance of Song 6 illustrate the richness of such variation.

Example 3. Excerpt of Song 6B

One sees small variations within and between the paired b sections and further repetitions of the song cast up still more. The following fragments are variants for bracketed section 1 of the above example.
Example 4. Excerpt of Song 6B

Because the order of magnitude of variation is minute, the basic integrity of Naraya songs remains undisturbed. Song 6 presents an interesting example of the constancy of Emily's songs, even when performed on two different occasions, two years apart. At the same time, one hears and sees the constancy of variation.

Example 5. Songs 6A and 6B

The tiny variations in Naraya song performance are in no sense the result of carelessness, but rather acceptable play within narrow limits. Elsewhere I have noted this same practice in Shoshone ceremonial songs (Vander 1978:9, 11, 131-134). Indeed, one finds it in virtually all Shoshone song genres. George List (pers. comm., 1982) pointed out to me similar findings in his study of South American Indian music, referring to this process as "random" or "continuous" variation.

It is interesting to compare some of the available published transcriptions of Paiute music with Emily's Naraya songs. Paired patterns are common as are slight
alterations in their repetition within the songs. The following three examples are from Steward's "Ethnography of Owens Valley Paiute" (Steward 1933:279).

**Example 6. Doctor's Song**

![Musical notation for Example 6](image)

**Example 7. Bad Dream Song**

![Musical notation for Example 7](image)

Steward also noted one variation which occurred between song repetitions (Steward 1933:283).

**Example 8. Excerpts from (16) Circle Dance Song**

![Musical notation for Example 8](image)

As a coda to this first section on inexact repetition, I'd like to suggest other practices which contribute to the total effect of dynamic symmetry. For example, portamento between notes, such as one finds in the a section of Song 1, adds to the repertoire of dynamic symmetry:
Example 9. Excerpt from Song 1

The release of notes — sliding either up or down to an indeterminate pitch as the voice simultaneously fades away — is still another variant.

Example 10. Excerpt from Song 12

Tiny variations in melodic pitch are another source of dynamic symmetry. Song 5 presents a good example of this:

Example 11. Excerpt from Song 5

There are also examples of half-spoken, half-sung text, such as that used in Song 7.

Example 12. Excerpt from Song 7

Fluctuation of amplitude is another strategy for variation, as seen in the excerpts of the following examples.

Example 13. Excerpts from Songs 6B and 14A

One can clearly hear the many minute variations in the song repetitions when one or two singers perform. Does this also occur when there are many singers, and if so, who leads and how? Even in a performance by two singers there is evidently a song leader. While listening to Naraya songs of herself and Dorothy singing together, Emily would sometimes state which of them was the “leader.” The leader knows the song very well, starts it off, and makes the final performance
decisions in a strong voice which the other singer or singers follow. According to Emily the man who sponsors the Ghost Dance generally also leads the songs, but others help out and lead songs as well. Unfortunately, there is no information concerning the number of variants in an actual Ghost Dance song performance by many people and the dynamics of such a performance remain obscure.

Unequal Pairing or Balancing

Within the repeated, symmetrical scheme of the Naraya songs slightly variant repetition is, as we have seen, a principal means for introducing asymmetrical, dynamic effects. Unequal pairing or balancing is another important source of asymmetry in the songs. If one examines the phrase lengths of the different sections within each song, one finds that with the exceptions of Songs 3 and 4, they are never the same (see Table II).

Another kind of pairing or balancing refers to the use of alternates, a concept developed by McAllester (1980:11) in "The First Snake Song."

A further kind of relief introduced into the over-all repetitiveness of Navajo music and poetry is through several varieties of alternation. . . . There is alternation in the kind of melodic activity, between level sections based entirely or largely on the tonic, and active sections. . . . The use of two note values creates another kind of alternation. . . . Textual alternations . . . alternate the vowels e and a.

The following are some of the sets of alternates which one finds within the Naraya songs. The first set of alternates contrasts syllabic versus melismatic text setting.

Example 14. Excerpt from Song 5

Song 5 is primarily syllabic. Melisma occurs on only the second syllable of the word for pine tree, wongâ, in section a. There is no balance between syllabic and melismatic settings; rather, a singular use of melisma draws attention to itself, set against a syllabic backdrop. Melisma, principally used in such a singular, noteworthy manner, occurs in 10 of the 17 songs. (See Table III.) The extensive use of melisma in the b section of Song 14, is an interesting exception.

Another set of alternates occurs at this same, melismatic point of the melody of Song 5. The only use of sixteenth notes occurs on the melisma and contrasts with the rest of the songs which moves primarily in eighth notes. The syncopated figure in section b, ♫♪♫♪♫, like the melisma and the sixteenth notes, is used in a single instance and stands out in relief from its unsyncopated surroundings.
### Table II

Phrase Lengths
Musical Section (beats)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>c</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6A, B</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>8(a(^1)), 7(\frac{1}{2}) (a(^2))</td>
<td>6(b(^1)), 6(\frac{1}{2}) (b(^2))</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11A, B</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>6(\frac{1}{2}) (b(^1)), 5(\frac{1}{2}) (b(^2))</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14A, B</td>
<td>18(a(^1)), 12(a(^2))</td>
<td>24(b(^1)), 27(b(^2))</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>5(b(^1)), 6(b(^2))</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table III

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Pitch Material (tonic underlined)</th>
<th>Melodic Intervals</th>
<th>Melisma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ACDE</td>
<td>m2 M2 m3 M3 P4 P5 m7 8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>0 X X 0 X 0 0 0 0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>CDE</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>AcDE</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>ACD</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>ACF#G</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6A</td>
<td>AcDE</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6B</td>
<td>EABCd</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>BDE</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>GACDE</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>GBcD</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>ACD</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11A</td>
<td>ACD</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>ACD</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>GACDE</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14A</td>
<td>GACD</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>CDEF</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>EACDE</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>G#BD</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
One also finds this syncopated figure in a variety of Paiute music, as in the following examples.

**Example 15.** Excerpt of (4) Funeral Song of the Owens Valley Paiute (Steward 1933:280)

![Example 15](image)

**Example 16.** Badger-Chief’s Myth Recitative of the Kaibab Paiute (Sapir 1910:461)

![Example 16](image)

**Example 17.** Excerpt of the first Paiute Hand Game Song on the Library of Congress Record (AAFS L38), Great Basin: Paiute, Washo, Ute, Bannock, Shoshone, collected by Willard Rhodes

![Example 17](image)

This syncopated pattern also appears in Naraya Songs 10, 11, and 13.

Another set of alternates contrasts duple with triple rhythmic organization. Although I avoid the use of standard time signatures because the bar-line groupings and implied pattern of accents are inappropriate, nevertheless, the underlying rhythmic organization of each song suggests that it either moves in twos or some multiple thereof, or in threes or some multiple thereof. Song 12 alternates the two types of rhythmic organization, moving in twos through its a section and threes through its b section. Song 15 also uses two rhythmic organizations: sections a and c move in threes, section b moves in twos.

Another pair of alternates contrasts types of melodic movement. For example, section a of Song 12 oscillates between neighboring tones C and D; whereas section b undulates and creates a sense of motion. Ten of the seventeen songs fall into this pattern, contrasting an active melodic section with a more static section, often oscillating between two neighboring tones (see Table IV).

Tonal centers offer another possible set of alternates.
Table IV
Songs with Contrasting Melodic Movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>a</th>
<th></th>
<th>b</th>
<th></th>
<th>c</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6A, B</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11A, B</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>active</td>
<td></td>
<td>static</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>active</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table V

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Starting Notes of Phrases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4, 4, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2, 2, 2, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1, 1, VI, VI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3, 3, 3, 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6A, B</td>
<td>4, 4, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>2, 2, 2, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>4, 5, 4, 5, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>4, 3, 4, 5, 4, 5, 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>4, 4, 3 (?), 1 (?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11A, B</td>
<td>4, 4, 4, 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>2, 2, 2, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>2 (?), 3 (?), 3, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14A, B</td>
<td>2, 2, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>1, 1, 1, 1, 2, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>5, 4, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>3, 1, 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total of 74 starting notes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note of Scale</th>
<th>Number of Starting Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI (below tonic)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (tonic)</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example 18. Song 13

The reiteration of and cadence on D in section a of Song 13 clearly established D as its tonal center. The melodic movement in the b section touches on D for only one of its six-and-a-half beats, and the cadence ends on a reiterated C. Three of the six-and-a-half beats in section b are on C. Looking at the entire song, twelve-and-a-half beats are on D and seven beats on C. What is the tonal center of Song 13, D or C? D for section a and C for section b? The cadence note of a final section of a song is persuasive. If the tonal center were C, then the song starts on the second note of the scale, the most common starting note of the Naraya songs. Including Song 13, seven of the seventeen songs start on the second scale tone (see Table V). If D were the tonal center, then the final cadence would be on VII, a singular example for the final cadence of a concluding section. (Section a of Song 15 cadences on VII; however, section b cadences on the tonic. Likewise, section b of Song 8 cadences on VII, surrounded by sections a and c which cadence on the tonic.) Perhaps there simply are two tonal centers. Songs 10 and 14 also present ambiguous questions of tonality.

Song 13 is also remarkable for its alternate b sections. The differences between sections b\(^1\) and b\(^2\) exceed the usual magnitude of variation. There are significant rhythmic differences between the two sections and they are not sung interchangeably, that is, b\(^1\) is always sung first followed by b\(^2\).

Example 19. Excerpt of Song 13

The syncopated rhythm of section b\(^1\), dib dib, begins on the beat. On-the-beat beginnings are congruent with the Shoshone texts which characteristically place the accent on the first syllable of words. In both sections b\(^1\) and b\(^2\) the musical setting for sógövi, Mother Earth, stresses the second syllable, violating the normal spoken pattern. Within section b\(^2\) one finds a certain tension stemming from the alternate play of downbeat versus upbeat phrasing. On the one hand, the melodic movements from D to C to A are all anticipated on the second half of each preceding beat, forging a connection between the two.
Example 20A. Excerpt of Song 13

On the other hand, Dorothy’s phrasing and the text work against this connection.

Example 20B.

The play of downbeat versus upbeat phrasing has particular relevance for the musical sections. The sectional division as shown in Example 19 is dictated by the text. But from a purely rhythmical standpoint, one could argue that the division should be:

Example 21. Excerpt of Song 13

At issue here is a compression at the border between the sections. Because of the tonic cadence on C for the final word in the text, I conclude that the first note of section b\(^2\) is an upbeat which begins precipitously on the second half of the final beat of section b\(^1\) (see ex. 19). Such compression, confounding the sectional divisions, also occurs between sections a\(^2\) and b\(^1\) of Song 10. Song 14 presents the most fascinating example; here one is unsure where one section ends and another begins.

Example 22. Excerpts of Song 14

The cadential point of repeated section a shortens the first cadential D by three beats and omits the final A. As one anticipates the concluding A, it is easy to be
deceived and connect the D with the beginning notes of section b. The confusion of endings and beginnings is even more striking at the junction between the two b sections.

Example 23. Excerpts of Song 14A

The second and concluding b section ends on a reiterated C which is set off by rests. The text of the reiterated Cs, ena, is a vocable used exclusively in these songs as an ending text (see Songs 11, 14, and 16). The cadence of the first b section omits the second C and immediately begins the repeat which also starts on C, fulfilling and at the same time fooling our expectations for a second, cadential C. Thus, the incomplete cadence of the first section b actually functions as the beginning for the repeat of section b. (Song 17 presents another example of elided beginnings and endings.)

Obscurity of the phrase division is, in fact, an exception to the usual application of its opposite — clear demarcation of musical sections. As a rule, phrase endings conclude abruptly on a short note followed by a rest, as in the following section a of Song 7.

Example 24. Excerpt of Song 7

Other ending cues can be seen in Songs 6 and 7, whose final notes simultaneously fade and glide down to an indeterminate lower pitch. Final notes of an entire song performance often receive a parting accent (see Songs 5, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 14, and 17).

Flow and Flux in Naraya Song Form

Because phrases are clearly marked and invariably repeat, it is easy to see and understand Herzog’s and my analytical division of Ghost Dance song form and my application of the same tendency to divide into component parts. Powers has pointed out the problems of such a Euro-American analytical model when applied to non-Euro-American musical traditions, problems which are germane to Emily’s
Naraya songs (Powers 1980:25). Although musical phrases and sections are clearly defined, there are at the same time aspects of melody and rhythm which relate to one another and cut across their analytical pigeonholes. Recall Witherspoon’s paradigm for dynamic symmetry, the “flow and flux found in nature and in the proportions of the human body and the growing plant.” (Witherspoon 1977:199) Using nature as our model, let us now look for the inter-relatedness of parts, musical motifs which combine and recombine and integrate much as molecules do in the natural world.

The evolution of melody and its gradual shift of tonal center in Song 10 epitomize the inter-related substructure which unifies Emily’s Naraya songs. There is a progressive change in melodic focus which threads through every section of the entire song. The first half of both a sections establishes A as the tonic. But if one views in sequence the second halves of the a sections and moves forward through the two b sections, one finds a consistent movement and gravitation to C as a new tonal center. In this light, it is interesting to note the brief cadence on A in section b1, a subtle yet unmistakable reference and connection to sections a1 and a2.

Example 25. Excerpts of Song 10

As in Song 13, rhythmically compressed sectional divisions in Song 1 (between a2 and b1, b1 and b2) enhance the flow and movement from one section to another. This flow, combined with the progressive shift in tonal centers throughout the entire song, breaks down analytical divisions and separations.

The inter-relatedness of parts is very striking in Song 3. One can isolate two melodic molecules which combine to form the melodies for sections a and b. The first melodic molecule which I label x, is a group of three eighth notes which moves from a first pitch to a repeated single pitch, \( \text{\textit{x}} \) (higher) or \( \text{\textit{x}} \) (lower). Melodic molecule y is a group of three eighth notes repeating a single pitch, \( \text{\textit{y}} \). There is a progression of patterns as the music always carries over something from a previous section while adding a new element or presentation. The first subsection in a presents two x patterns, \( x^1x^2 \). The second subsection presents a third \( x^3 \) pattern and a new pattern y. The first subsection in b repeats \( x^3y \) and its concluding subsection uses a variant \( x^4y \) pattern. The only identical repeat of patterns occurs in the center of the song. The \( x^3y \) pattern which both concludes section a and begins section b cuts across different musical sections and lines of text.
Example 26. Song 3

Mugua, the Shoshone word for soul, provides a parallel beginning for every section and subsection. The four musical settings of mugua use a parallel pattern, but note the likenesses, differences, and progressions between them.

Example 27. Excerpts from Song 3

Beyond the identical two inner settings already noted, there are other cross-sectional relationships as well. The progressive movement from larger to smaller melodic intervals, perfect fourth, minor third, to major second, relates and integrates the four x patterns.

Elements of inter-relationships mesh with elements of unequal balance. Although the four settings of mugua use x patterns which move from one pitch to a repeated higher pitch, note the asymmetrical difference of the final pattern. Unlike its three predecessors it does not begin on A but on G below A, moving up to a repeated A. Similarly, if one looks at the song as a whole, one notes the use of an x pattern in every subsection and at the same time the unequal balance between three xy patterns and one xx pattern. The two inner x^3y subsections, like a fulcrum, in exactly balance the beginning x^1x^2 pattern with the concluding x^4y subsection.

In contrast to Song 3, the relationship between sections a and b of Song 4 is like a melodic sequence. Section b repeats melodic patterns of section a, starting on a lower scale tone. Although "inexact and imperfect," one can see and hear the related up and down movement between neighboring scale tones (C-D in section a and A-C in section b) and rhythmic similarities which reflect the close relationship of the texts of the two sections.

Example 28. Song 4
In Song 5 it is the skeletal key melodic points of sections $a$ and $b$ which bear a strong resemblance and relate one to the other.

**Example 29. Song 5**

Section $b$ merely simplifies the melodic movement of section $a$, omitting the F$\#$ and slightly prolonging the A.

In other songs there is a melodic relationship between beginnings and endings of different sections. For example, in Songs 8 and 11, the melodic ending of one section strongly influences the beginning melody of the section which follows.

**Example 30. Excerpts of Song 8 and Song 11A**

*Plains Influence on the Naraya Songs*

The substructural complexities and inter-relationships within Emily's Naraya songs do not invalidate their basic congruence with Herzog's analysis of Plains Ghost Dance musical style. As Emily sings these songs today, more than fifty years after Herzog published his article, they corroborate his musical analysis and his contention for their stylistic durability across time and across musical
boundaries. There are, however, two exceptions to this stylistic durability, exceptions which place in relief the strength of the general rule.

The form of Song 9 is unique to the entire repertory of 17 songs, superimposing and synthesizing Plains and Ghost Dance musical forms. Whereas paired patterns characterize Ghost Dance and Great Basin song form, incomplete repetition characterizes Plains song form (Nettl 1954:25). Recent articles on Ogalala Sioux songs by Powers and on Ojibwa songs by Vennum propose almost identical analyses for this form. Powers represents the performance of Ogalala song form thus: A A' B C B C (Powers 1980:31). Although Vennum’s diagrammatic scheme is almost identical to Powers’, detailed explanation of the sections and their inter-relationships has particular relevance to Emily’s Song 9. According to Vennum, A is the first phrase sung by the lead singer, A' is the repeat of the phrase by the rest of the singers.

After this double introduction, the main body of the melody follows . . . called the ‘development’ . . . The term ‘development’ seems appropriate, for the melody at this point, more often than not, is composed of phrases closely related to the introduction — (A²), (A³) — and/or new phrases — (B), (C), (D), etc. — which develop material from the introduction. Such development may consist of a continuation of rhythmic patterns, dynamic stresses, or melodic contours appearing in the introduction . . . The development section is concluded with a cadential formula which may be an extension of the final phrase of the development or detached from it (X) . . . . The group then performs the incomplete repetition, which is a restatement of the development section . . . . It is termed ‘incomplete’ because it omits the introductory phrases (AA¹). (Vennum 1980:49, 50)

The form of Song 9 combines the principles of incomplete repetition and paired repetition. The two large sections are labelled I and II, so as not to be confused with the smaller units. It is only through scrutiny of the small units — a, b, c, and x — that one comprehends the synthesis of its two underlying forms. On a miniature scale, units a, b, c, and x relate to Vennum’s A, B, C, and X. Accordingly, a serves as introduction (unlike Ojibwa song form, unrepeated as there is no lead singer-chorus musical context). The ensuing b unit reuses the rhythmic pattern, \( m \), of a as well as the opening melodic pattern which in b begins on a lower scale tone and is also abbreviated. The cadential x unit derives from the last three notes of units a and b and brings the entire first section to a close.
Example 31. Song 9

Unit c which begins the second section of the song uses the same rhythmic pattern $\frac{3}{4}$, as in units a and b, and its text, niam biya, refers in abbreviated form to the important word, mother, used in b. Unit c serves as a tiny introduction to the return both in text and music of cadential unit x. If Song 9 followed Vennum's and Power's model for incomplete repetition, it would end after units c and x. This form — abx cx — would easily fit Herzog's analysis of Plains musical forms, utilizing two of the five formal procedures which he described in his paper: "Modified repetition . . . substituting an altogether new phrase: abc dboe, etc.,” and "Curtailment of a section by leaving out one or two phrases, very often initially: abc b, etc." (Herzog 1935:409) However, the second section of Song 9 goes on to repeat units cx; thus the song form reverts to the sine qua non of Ghost Dance songs — paired patterns. In summary, drawing on two musical styles, the form of Song 9 is:

\[
\begin{array}{cc}
\text{I} & \text{II} \\
\text{x} & \text{x} \\
\text{cx} & \text{cx} \\
\end{array}
\]

Like form, the melodic contour of Song 9 also combines characteristics of Plains and Ghost Dance-Great Basin musical styles. Concerning the type of melodic contour which one finds in Plains songs, Nettl writes:

The melodic movement . . . is primarily descending. . . . Each phrase descends, and each begins somewhat lower than the previous one.
Towards the end of a song the phrases do not usually descend as much as at the beginning, but they tend to flatten out, as it were, the last phrase lingering on the final, lowest pitch for several notes. . . . This type of melodic movement as a whole is called the “terrace-type” because of its visual resemblance to terraces in its graphic expression. (Nettl 1954:24, 25)

The melodic movement and contour of section I and II of Song 9 inscribe a very striking terrace-type outline. The following skeletal outline of key melodic focal points brings out the underlying terraced structure of the melody.

*Example 32. Song 9*

In contrast to the descending terraced contour of the Plains, Nettl (1954:15) characterizes the Great Basin melodic movement as “descending, undulating, and arc-shaped progression . . . most of the phrases . . . end on the tonic; this contrasts with most other styles, whose phrase endings tend to fall on different tones with the last one only on the tonic.” Emily’s Naraya songs fit this description with only Song 9 presenting a definite terrace-type contour. At the same time, note that every small unit of both sections cadences, albeit briefly, on the tonic.

Although Song 9 is in some ways a singular exception, there is one aspect of Plains musical style which is present in all of Emily’s Naraya songs. Emily’s vocal quality demonstrates some degree of vocal tension and pulsation occurs on long notes. This does not conform with Nettl’s comments on Ghost Dance songs.

The vocal technique of the Paiute and Ghost Dance songs is generally free of pulsation and vocal tension. . . . This is true even in those Ghost Dance songs which are performed by tribes whose general style of singing contains pulsation and vocal tension, such as those of the Plains. (Nettl 1954:17)
TEXTUAL ANALYSIS

In an attempt to render faithfully the song texts to the reader, I have transcribed the Shoshone words as they appear in the song which may vary from the way they are spoken. Different presentations of the same word within a song or between songs are likewise maintained. The following is a key to the orthography:

\[
\begin{array}{ll}
   a & \text{father} \\
   e & \text{pay} \\
   ê & \text{about} \\
   i & \text{keep} \\
   ī & \text{silt} \\
   ó & \text{no} \\
   o & \text{ought} \\
   u & \text{lyte} \\
   ŭ & \text{put} \\
   ai & \text{try} \\
   oi & \text{noise} \\
   g & \text{all g's are hard, as in gag} \\
\end{array}
\]

Accent generally falls on the first syllable and every other syllable after that.

I am unable to present a comparison of sung texts versus spoken texts because the combination of older, even obscure Shoshone words and song modification of other words made it too difficult for Emily to analyze and explain all of these matters to me. Finally, my discussion of song texts follows a classification according to subject matter rather than chronological order.
Nature Texts

In broadest terms, the Naraya texts deal with two subjects: the living world of nature (thirteen songs) and the life of the soul after death (four songs). The text to Song 1 provides a good entrance to the Naraya world of nature.

Song 1

Damén doiyá vaig-e vagíña havenorē,
Our mountains above fog lying while moving,

Damén doiyá vaig-e vagíña havenorē.
Our mountains above fog lying while moving.

Vagíña vagíña vagíña havenorē,
Fog fog fog lying while moving,

Vagíña vagíña vagíña havenorē.
Fog fog fog lying while moving.

Emily explained the meaning of this song as she looked out of her bedroom window at the foothills of the Wind River Mountains. Fog lies on the side of the mountains, stretching out for a long ways. "Havên, you see it moving towards this way or that." Both the possessive pronoun, damên, our, and Emily's glance at the mountains suggest a strong reference and attachment to a particular place, a particular mountain — the Wind River Mountains. Writing about the Shoshones in an 1879 report to Washington, Colonel Brackett (1879:330) stated, "The Wind River Mountains are supposed by the Indians to be the home of the spirits, and they believe a person can see the spirit land, or the land they will occupy after death, from the top of them." Shimkin (1947a:332) likewise notes that the setting for Wind River Shoshone myths "seems to be that of the Wind River-Teton intermountain zone." Vine Deloria, Jr. (1979:75) stresses this spatial dimension and attachment of tribal religions. "American Indians hold their lands — places — as having the highest possible meaning, and all their statements are made with this reference point in mind." Ten of the seventeen songs have either a mountain setting or refer to the mountains — the Wind River Mountains (see Songs 1, 3, 5, 7, 8, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15, and 16).

It is significant that the word fog is repeated many times in the text. The different forms and states of water — running water, snow, fog — abound in many of the texts and provide in protean forms an image and concern of central importance. Emily tells of the vision of the Shoshone man who urged people to dance around him as he lay on the ground as if dead, a vision which articulates the importance of water in Shoshone thought. After the man's soul came out of the top of his head, it landed on a green grassy spot and then ascended to the sky. The soul climbed higher and higher until it could look down and see the whole earth
which from that great distance appeared shiny and watery. In the soul’s vision the whole earth was nothing but water.

Shoshone stories show a related concern for water. Shimkin (1947a:330) reports that the ending for Shoshone tales obscurely hints “at melting snow, which results from properly told tales.” He translates this stereotyped ending, “Coyote way out there is tracking through slush.” (Shimkin 1947a:335) Shimkin further notes the absence of landscape descriptions in Shoshone tales, and it is therefore interesting to note the one exception in his collection of stories.

Here is water
Here is the Water Buffalo’s lair
Here is blue-edged water
Here many trees are standing (Shimkin 1947a:341)

From this description one perceives the speaker’s appreciation for the beauty of water and for its life-giving function to plants and animals.

The concern for water is ancient. One senses Shoshone western origins and arid cradle in their generic word for tree, sehevi, which is at the same time their word for the cottonwood tree (Tidzump 1970:5). Trager (1964:467) points out this linguistic identification in the southwest where “the only deciduous trees that grow in abundance outside of the forests on the mountain slopes are the cottonwoods.”

Even today, Shoshones live in a dry environment; most of their reservation land is dry sage country. Hay, vegetables, berry bushes, cottonwoods, willows all grow when watered by creeks and irrigation ditches. Not surprisingly, Wovoka’s songs, born in the dry alkaline country of the Paiute, also express concern for water. Mooney (1965:15) wrote, “I learned that Wovoka has five songs for making it rain, the first of which brings on a mist or cloud, the second a snowfall, the third a shower, and the fourth a hard rain or storm, while when he sings the fifth song the weather again becomes clear.”

The construction of the poetic text for Song 1 helps to focus attention on the word fog, and on the notion of fog stretching out in space for a long distance. The second line repeats vagina three times; length of textual time serves as metaphor for length of space.

Naraya texts, like Naraya music, sometimes show resemblances and relationships which cut across sections, binding and integrating. The second phrase of Song 1 elaborates the last two words of the first line.

One senses that much of the meaning of the text still lies locked inside. Speaking of Naraya Shimkin (1947a:350) writes, “The texts are cryptic descriptions of visions, fully understood only by their authors.”

We shall proceed to Songs 6, 7, 11, 12, 13, and 14 which all mention water as well as other images drawn from nature.

Song 6

Gwinan gas dugumbaiyu,
Eagle’s wing is skying,
Gwinan gas duguimbaiyu.
Eagle's wing is sky ing.

Buhi ba róanzi marukandu havenoré.
Green water shiny under lying-moving.

Buhi ba róanzi marukandu havenoré.
Green water shiny under lying-moving.

Emily paraphrases the meaning of this text, "That eagle's flying, his wing's way up there in the sky, looking down to the earth and seeing the water, shining. And the grass on the earth, green." For the Shoshones, like many other North American Indian tribes, the eagle is a sacred bird. Medicine men use the eagle wing as a fan when healing the sick.

Emily made the above translation one year after she and her sister Dorothy sang this song for me. On the day of the actual performance, Dorothy said, "That's a song about angels flying up about Heaven, like that, flying." The two different verbal translations present a fascinating instance of symbolic translation between Shoshone and Christian religious thought. It is very possible that Dorothy's comments were for my benefit, helping me understand the religious implication. (In her Shoshone Thesaurus, Malinda Tidzump (1970:41) translates angel as kasadayvoq-kasa, wing, and dayvoq, white people.)

Song 7

Sena roiyabi sena roiyabende,
Quaking aspen tree mountain quaking aspen mountain,

Sena roiyabi sena roiyabende.
Quaking aspen tree mountain quaking aspen mountain.

Varëné wümínēge varëné wümínēge he,
Through water dragging across through water dragging across (vocable),

Varëné wümínēge varëné wümínēge he.
Through water dragging across through water dragging across (vocable).

Of this text Emily says, "Them trees, them aspen trees, . . . nothing but those kind of trees on the side of the mountain. . . . Where you drag something across the water . . . where the river is, dragging it." Whereas Song 6 paired water and green grass, Song 7 pairs water and a stand of aspens.

Using the concept of dynamic symmetry which was developed in the musical analysis, one can see its textual application in Song 7. There is inexact, unequal pairing within each line of text which divides in two. The second part repeats the first and adds an extra ending syllable.
The two lines themselves are paired in their type of construction; however, the differing number of syllables in each line (11 and 15, respectively) also produces an unequal pair. The presence of a concluding rhyme, as in Song 7, occurs in 11 of the 17 songs (see Songs 1, 2, 3, 4, 8, 9, 13, 15, 16, and 17).

Song 11A

Saiwai doiyavi saiwai doiyavi,
Snow melting mountain snow melting mountain,

Saiwai doiyavi saiwai doiyavi.
Snow melting mountain snow melting mountain.

Doiya dim-p-un dim-pvanzingô ora dim-pvanzingô ora enê.
Mountain rock rock slide rock slide (ending vocabale),

Doiya dim-p-un dim-pvanzingô ora dim-pvanzingô ora enê.
Mountain rock rock slide rock slide (ending vocabale).

Song 11B (a later performance)

Saiwai doiyavi saiwai doiyavi,
Snow melting mountain snow melting mountain,

Saiwai doiyavi saiwai doiyavi.
Snow melting mountain snow melting mountain.

Doiya dim-p-un dim-p-un muzare bangwenôgare enê,
Mountain rock rock cliff point water zigzagging down (ending (North Fork Mountain) vocabale),

Doiya dim-p-un dim-p-un muzare bangwenôgare enê.
Mountain rock rock cliff point water zigzagging down (ending (North Fork Mountain) vocabale).

Emily comments on this song, "It's something like snow on the mountains melting on those rocks that slide... cliff-like, they're underground. They show like this. ...Sai, it's something like snow going away from the mountains, melting. You see those mountains like this, ...cliffs ... some are like this, that's broke down. ... Dim-p dim-p muzare, that's the rocks. ... Dim-pûn muzar, it means North Fork Mountain, right here on that side. (Emily views North Fork Mountain from her bedroom window.) They call that mountain ñòsa dim-p muzari.
That's its name ... that mountain setting there." Talking about the alternate second line Emily said, "Ba, it's water down there, water going down like this." (Emily curved her hand back and forth.) A free translation of the first performance of Song 11 would be "Snow is melting on the rocky cliffs of the mountains." A free translation of the later performance would be, "Snow is melting on the mountain. Water from melted snow zigzags down over the rocky cliff point of North Fork Mountain."

Conversation with Emily reveals the specific quality of textual images. Particular place reference, particular mountain formations, and conditions of melting snow on rocks do not always clearly surface in their literal English translation, although they are clearly understood by Shoshones who sing the songs.

Like Song 7, each line of Song 11A divides in two; here the difference between the lines stems from the incomplete repetition within the second line of text, omitting doiya dim-p-iin at the beginning of the repetition and tacking on enê at the end, a vocable which indicates an ending. (By contrast, Song 11B's second line is one undivided line.) Rather than rhymes between the two lines of text, there are rhymes within each line of text. In the first line, saiawai rhymes with doiyavi.

Using the second line of the later performance, note the following interior rhymes: dim-p-iin (  ) and dim-p-iin (  ), muzare (  ) and bang wendôgâre (  ). The rhythmic setting of these words enhances their rhyme.

Song 12

Buyûna durua buyûna durua-gin,
Duck's ducklings duck's ducklings,

Buyûna durua buyûna durua-gin.
Duck's ducklings duck's ducklings.

Tsa paran bangwavinora,
Good water swimming,

Tsa paran bangwavinora.
Good water swimming.

Emily explains, "They're wild ducks, little baby ducks, they're swimming in the good water, going along, following each other." Like Song 7, the first line of Song 12 falls into two parts, the second part repeating the first and adding a new final syllable, gin. Unlike the first line, the second line is one unbroken phrase which drops the final syllable, a, when repeated. Thus, line two and its repeat parallel the construction within line one, only reversing the order of added and dropped syllables. Note the use of alternate vowel sounds, u in the first line (buyûna durua buyûna diguagin) and a in the second (tsa paran bangwavinora). In text, as in music, one finds inexact repetition and unequal pairing or balancing.
Song 13

Dósa doiyavi haveyínó,
White mountain lying,

Dósa doiyavi haveyínó.
White mountain lying.

Sógóvi wiňeyénô
Mother earth standing while shaking,

Sógóvi wiňeyénô
Mother earth standing while shaking.

Emily: "Snowy mountains, white mountains... Snow on the mountains. It means spreading all over the world — where it’s snowing." Dorothy: "You see these mountains, they’re long. That means haveyínó." Later Emily added, "It’s standing, wiňiganor, you know, the trees, when the wind’s blowing." This stronger vision of wind-driven snow which covers the earth may be a Ghost Dance symbol for the new world to come. In the following Paiute Ghost Dance text and commentary, Mooney suggests this interpretation.

The whirlwind! The whirlwind!  
The whirlwind! The whirlwind!  
The snowy earth comes gliding, the snowy earth comes gliding,  
The snowy earth comes gliding, the snowy earth comes gliding.

This song may possibly refer to the doctrine of the new earth, here represented as white with snow advancing swiftly, driven by a whirlwind.  
(Mooney 1965:291)

In Song 13, the number of syllables differs in the two lines of text (nine syllables in line one and eight or seven in line two). With the exception of Songs 1, 3, and 4, this is true of all the songs and is certainly a factor in the similarly irregular length of musical phrases and sections. The rhyme in Song 13 between line one and the concluding repetition of line two is here achieved by dropping the last syllable of the final word.

Song 14

Daka roïya seyana, \(a^1\)
Snow mountain melting,

Daka roïya seya- \(a^2\)
Snow mountain melt-
Emily: "Snowy mountains, melting. You know, when the sun’s on the mountains, you see that snow shining...when it’s kind of going to melt.... The mountains go like this, wiap, like this — sloped down like this and some melting."

This text is singular for its playful manipulation of words, creating rhymes within lines and rhymes between lines. The melismatic setting of the second line brings out this play on words (see Songs 14 A and B). The beginning of the second line of text is elided with the ending of the first line; the final syllable of the last word of line one, -na, is changed to -nó, and becomes the first syllable of line two. The rhyming within line two goes thus,

\[-nó
\[waró
\[wian ninó
\[paró
\[wian ninó\]

The elision of beginning and ending which occurred between line one and two also occurs at the beginning of the repeat of line two. The repeat begins with the final syllable of the preceding word, in this case again changing the -na to -nó in order to begin the sequence of rhymes. Ena, in its complete form at the end of line two rhymes with the last word of line one, seyana, and its incomplete form, seya-. The pattern of rhyme is thus,

\[Daka roiya seyang
\[Daka roiya seya\]

\[Nó
\[waró
\[wian ninó
\[paró
\[wian ninó e-\] line 2

\[Nó
\[waró
\[wian ninó
\[paró
\[wian ninó ena\] repeat of line 2
Some Naraya texts make no mention of snow or water, drawing images from insects, animals, the sun, or stars.

Song 5

Wóngó aiyépürünge wóngó aiyépürünge,
Pine tree butterfly pine tree butterfly,

Wóngó aiyépürünge wóngó aiyépürünge.
Pine tree butterfly pine tree butterfly.

Du wóngó darëwënda dukai-ye du-i yarokand,
Dark pine tree holes underneath dark flickering, fluttering,

Du wóngó darëwënda dukai-ye du-i yarokand.
Dark pine tree holes underneath dark flickering, fluttering.

Emily: It's the mountain butterflies, . . . big butterflies . . . . They fly under those shady trees, pine trees . . . . You see the mountains where the pine trees are dark. It's kind of shady-like. That's where those butterflies fly. That's what it means." Emily elaborated on the meaning of the verb yarókand. She held up one hand, motionless, with fingers spread apart and moved her other hand behind it. This was her demonstration of how one saw the butterflies (moving hand) flying under or through the shady pine boughs (motionless hand).

Construction of the two lines of text of Song 5 alternates a double repeated pattern in line one and a single "through-composed" second line. Line one is a fragment, and by reiterating the words for pine tree and butterfly it suggests many. Completion of the image unfolds in the longer text of the second line which provides the verb at the end of the line — the usual placement for Shoshone verbs. The repetition and placement of wóngó at the beginning of line two helps bind the two lines of text together.

Song 8

Damë Apande doiya rukwich,
Our Father's mountain lion,

Doiya dìvana dukaig miyawindë yaiyó waindë.
Mountain side below walking down yowling (vocale).

Damë Apande doiya rukwich,
Our Father's mountain lion,

Doiya dìvana dukaig miyawindë yaiyó waindë.
Mountain side below walking down yowling (vocale).
Emily: "Our Father's, our Creator's mountain lion walking around on the side of the mountain. All the animals, different kinds of animals that belong to Him — deer, elk, moose, mountain sheep, and antelope — little ones with the older ones — sitting down on the side of the mountain."

Concerning Wind River Shoshone religious beliefs Shimkin (1947a:331) writes,

The central figure in the worship of all Wind River Shoshone cults — Ghost Dance, Sun Dance, Peyote Cult, etc. — is damē'-ap-ē (Our Father), a vague, anthropomorphic somewhat Christianized being whom all informants now identify with the white man's God. Whether the concept is completely a loan from Christianity or whether it actually contains aboriginal elements remains a moot point. Direct Wind River Shoshone contacts with white culture began in 1805, with active religious proselytizing dating from 1834. But it must also be recognized that Basin Shoshone and Comanche alike show the concept of a heavenly Father.

Lowie presents fragments of the Wind River Shoshone concepts of the origins of living creatures. "Our own Father (A'pō) made us. First of all, he made the moose, then the elk, then the buffalo, then the deer, the mountain sheep, the antelope, the crane, the chief of the birds, the big black eagle, the white-tailed bald eagle, the chicken-hawk (ginī) and the ho'mara, the owl, the crow, the magpie, and the dogō a-rā'ka (snake-eater). Our Father made everything; he made us." (Lowie 1909a:272, 273) Both Lowie and Shimkin present some information which connects our Father with Coyote, an important trickster-hero of Shoshone stories. In the first Northern Shoshone story collected by Lowie (1909b:238), Coyote fathers a large brood of children. Those washed by Coyote are Shoshones, those washed by his wife comprise all the other Indian tribes. In "Dances and Societies of the Plains Shoshone" Lowie (1915:817) quotes the following Wind River Shoshone statements which identify Coyote as the Father and Creator of the world. "After the Father (A'pō) had created the world, there was a man and his wife and two children. Coyote came along and said, 'I am your father and made all these hills and trees.'" As recently as 1947, Shimkin (1947a:331) reports that, "One lonely individual has... built up his own system
of belief in Coyote as Creator and God." For completeness, it is interesting to note that within the wider Ghost Dance context, Mooney (1965:13) writes that Wovoka's "followers, both in his own and in all other tribes commonly refer to him as 'our Father.'" As part of his explanation for the word "father" in an Arapaho and a Sioux song text, Mooney (1965:279) adds that it is a term of reverence used for sacred things.

The textual construction of Song 8 uses two of the four sequential devices which Shirkin (1947a:339) found in Wind River Shoshone myths: parallel development and repetition. The key expression, Our Father, begins line one and line three of the text. The musical setting enhances the parallel construction of the text. The melody moves from repeated notes to the upper-neighbor tone and back down to the first pitch:

*Example 33. Excerpt of Song 8*

![Music notation]

The melody for the same words at the beginning of section c follows the same pattern, except that it begins on a different scale tone:

*Example 34. Excerpt of Song 8*

![Music notation]

In this case, the upper-neighbor tone is a minor third away rather than a major second. Not only is there a musical parallel for the setting of the first two words of sections a and c, but also a parallel transformation of the sung versus the spoken word for "father." Richley Crapo (pers. comm., 1981) pointed out that nasalization occurs in the sung version with the insertion of an "n" before "d" and "b" in the words Apunde and Apanbitê. Miller and Booth (1972: n.p.) note a similar change in Western Shoshone songs from Nevada. "The most common change is to make a hard letter into a nasal letter." Going beyond Shoshone, Hinton (1980:298) writes concerning Havasupai song texts, "I would also like to point out that in songs containing real words, a series of phonological processes are employed that also result in the increased use of . . . nasals."

One sees paired progression in Song 8, that is, rather than single repeated lines there are two different lines which then repeat. The repetition in the second line of the word for mountain, döiya, underscores the mountain setting as it links the two lines of text. The musical setting of line three brings out its series of interior rhymes:
Example 35. Excerpts of Song 8

(The "n" in duanzi is another example of song nasalization.) The final vocable in line three rhymes with its counterpart in line two, drawing together and relating the first two lines with the last.

Song 4

Daměn dave-děn göve dősave yuwenorē,
Our sun’s face white set while moving,

Daměn dave-děn göve dősave yuwenorē.
Our sun’s face white set while moving.

Daměn davedōn guhenō dave yuwenorē,
Our sun’s going moving sun set while moving,

Daměn davedōn guhenō dave yuwenorē.
Our sun’s going moving sun set while moving.

Emily: "It's a prayer song to sun. It's about the sun; the sun's face is white. You can't see it... You can't look at the sun, it's too strong... The sun's face is white, warming up the world. It's a-going — sundown... When it's going down it cuts the light. Light shining like a can is shining."

Two Wind River Shoshones who worked with different anthropologists in this century tried to dispel what they felt was a serious misunderstanding of Shoshone religious beliefs concerning the sun. Tom Compton, a Sun Dance Chief in 1937, commented, "In the Sun Dance there is no worship of the Sun. It is through the Sun." (Shimkin 1953:463) About a decade earlier, Dick Washakie expanded on this notion more fully. "The reason the Indian seems to worship the sun to some people is because the Indian believes that the sun is a gift from God,
our Father above, to enlighten the world and as the sun appears over the horizon they offer up a prayer in acceptance of our Father’s gift.” (Hebard 1930:293)

Like Song 8, Song 4 uses parallel construction. The second line takes a different turn just before the final verb, repeating the important word of the text, sun. The musical setting of the second line likewise uses a parallel pattern, a melodic sequence which starts on a lower pitch (see ex. 28).

One finds new applications of dynamic symmetry in Song 4. Each line contrasts a new set of alternates, normal speech accents versus altered speech accents. Only Songs 4 and 9 begin with an upbeat, which in both cases moves from a short to a long note. In Song 4 the resulting agogic accent on the second syllable of the first two words, damēn dave, reverses the normal speech accent which falls on the first syllable. Both lines of text contrast the altered accents on the important words, our sun, with the remainder of each line whose agogic and dynamic accents agree with accents of everyday speech. The varied accent patterns for the key word, sun, present another example of cross-linear relationships and of unequal pairing. If one extracts the word, sun, from the text, the following pattern emerges.

Line 1  
\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{dave} \\
\text{dave}
\end{array}
\]

Line 2  
\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{dave} \\
\text{dave}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{dave} \\
\text{dave}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{dave} \\
\text{dave}
\end{array}
\]

Song 15

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Damē navoi dazimi doih-in,} \\
\text{Our morning star coming up,}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Damē navoi dazimi doih-in.} \\
\text{Our morning star coming up.}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Vagō dave wōgin,} \\
\text{Clear sun rays streaming out,}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Vagō dave wōgin.} \\
\text{Clear sun rays streaming out.}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Daziümbe garegīn,} \\
\text{Star sitting,}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Daziümbe garegīn.} \\
\text{Star sitting.}
\end{array}
\]

Emily: “Morning Star, song about Morning Star. . . . Navoi daziūmb means towards morning, when daylight’s coming up — Morning Star coming up with that light. It’s been sitting up there just before daybreak.” Emily later explained that
wágín refers to the sun’s rays which stream out when the sun itself is still below the horizon.

The Morning Star has particular Ghost Dance significance, which Mooney describes after the following Arapaho Ghost Dance text.

Father, the Morning Star!
Father, the Morning Star!
Look on us, we have danced until daylight,
Look on us, we have danced until daylight.
Take pity on us — Hi’i’i’i’!
Take pity on us — Hi’i’i’i’!

This song is sung about daylight, just before the closing song, after the dancers have danced all night and are now ready to quit and go home. When the new doctrine came among the prairie tribes, the Ghost dance was held at irregular and frequent intervals, almost every other night, in fact — lasting sometimes until about midnight, sometimes until daylight, without any rule. As the ceremonial became crystalized, however, the messiah gave instructions that the dance should be held only at intervals of six weeks, and should then continue four consecutive nights, lasting the first three nights until about midnight, but on the fourth night to continue all night until daylight of the next morning. . . . This song to the morning star was sung just before daylight on the final morning of the dance.

With all the prairie tribes the morning star is held in great reverence and is the subject of much mythological belief and ceremony." (Mooney 1965:261, 262)

Although Emily recalls dancing only until midnight, it is possible that Song 15 survives and bears witness to earlier days when Shoshones, like other Ghost Dancers, danced until daybreak.

To the south, Shoshone relatives, the Comanches, used the same sunrise imagery in one of their songs:

The sun’s beams are running out — He’e yo!
The sun’s beams are running out — He’e yo!
(Mooney 1965:283)

The Comanche words for this song, ță’bi, sun and wo’n’gin, streaming out, relate closely to dave wágín in Emily’s text (Mooney 1965:284).

The selective use of melisma only on the last word of each line of Song 15 underscores the rhyme which occurs at the same point of the text. Song 15 is the only Naraya text with three repeated lines. Within Mooney’s collection of Arapaho songs (mostly Southern Arapaho) 35 of 73 songs are made of three repeated lines (Mooney 1965:206-262). One wonders whether the neighboring Northern Arapaho Ghost Dance songs exerted any influence on the Shoshone Naraya songs.
Song 16

Danën doiyavi dua-n-zi waneya,
Our mountain child (diminutive) curving down,

Danën doiyavi dua-n-zi waneya.
Our mountain child (diminutive) curving down.

Waniya waniya waneya,
curving down curving down curving down,

Waniya waniya waneya.
curving down curving down curving down.

Emily: "That means mountains, going over the small mountains... Just wander around in the mountains. Waniya is something like... down, like a curve... going down."

Song 17

music text

a line 1 Huchi nüwiran deen nare总书记 dewan e-
white (?)

b 1 line 2 -Na wirapeya nangan e-
(concl. of ending vocable) hear (?)

b 2 abbrev. line 1 -Na nare总书记 dewan ena.
(concl. of ending vocable) white (?) (ending voc.)

Emily: "I don't know, it's something like a voice, somebody's voice. You hear a voice someplace, something like sound someplace." At a later time Emily added, "Something like singing and a white thing standing up, or something like that... I really don't know that. That song's from Nevada. Some of the words are a little bit different from ours. It means something. They know."

Both the text and music of Song 17 depart from the usual Naraya patterns. The first line of text and music is not repeated; the text for the musical repeat of b reverts in abbreviated form to line one. In Song 17 one sees the elision and play of textual and musical endings and beginnings described in the musical analysis of Song 14 on pages 29, 30. The musical setting of ena, an ending vocable, melismatically fuses with the beginning of line two and abbreviated line one. As a consequence, instead of rhymed repetition of ena at the conclusion of each line, one hears the following pattern:

line 1 Huchi ............... dewan
line 2 Ena ............... nangan
abbreviated line 1 Ena ............... dewan ena
Texts Concerning Life of the Soul

While most of the Naraya texts evoke the living world of nature, four of the seventeen texts present images and concepts of life of the soul after death.

Song 3

Mugua vaginave mugua vaginave,
Soul fog soul fog,

Mugua vaginave mugua vaginave.
Soul fog soul fog.

Mugua yizikanzi mugua yizikanzi,
Soul floating, flying up, soul floating, flying up,

Mugua yizikanzi mugua yizikanzi.
Soul floating, flying up, soul floating, flying up.

Emily: "The soul is like a fog when it gets out of the body. . . . Well, when a person dies the soul goes out of the body and it flies in the air. . . . It flies away from you. . . . Then they go to God's home. . . . When the body's already in the ground."

One sees conceptual continuity of Emily's belief with Lowie's account of Northern Shoshone beliefs which he described in 1909. "The Soul. The principle of life which departs at death is called mu'gua. During life its seat is in the head. . . . The common belief seems to be that the mu'gua of a dead Indian rises immediately until it reaches Wolf's house. There it is washed and revived by Wolf. While rising, they look like clouds." (Lowie 1909b:226) Wovoka himself uses the same imagery. In his speech to Cheyenne and Arapaho delegates in 1891 Wovoka said, "Jesus is now upon the earth. He appears like a cloud." (Mooney 1965:23) Commenting on Wovoka's entire speech Mooney writes,

The mythology of the doctrine is only briefly indicated, but the principal articles are given. The dead are all arisen and the spirit hosts are advancing and have already arrived at the boundaries of this earth, led forward by the regenerator in shape of cloud-like indistinctness. The spirit captain of the dead is always represented under this shadowy semblance. (Mooney 1965:24)

The text to Song 3 uses parallel construction:

Line 1 soul fog, soul fog
Line 2 soul flies up, soul flies up
There is noteworthy exactness of symmetry and regularity. Both lines are made of two units of seven syllables, all the units rhyme. The symmetrical text provides a foil for its asymmetrical musical setting, discussed earlier.

The text to Song 10 continues the progress of the soul after it has left the body.

**Song 10**

*Deya hukimbënzì deya yoriendë,*  
Small dust [=whirlwind] whirlwind (abbrev.) flying up,

*Deya hukimbënzì deya yoriendë.*  
Small dust [=whirlwind] whirlwind (abbrev.) flying up.

**Boi doiyara buhi havenorë,**  
Road mountain’s green lying while moving,

**Boi doiyara buhi havenorë.**  
Road mountain’s green lying while moving.

Emily: “When a person dies they go in a dust whirlwind. They go up in the mountains. There’s a road for that, there’s a green pass through there, where they go. You see that whirlwind, they go way up there. There’s a road up the mountains where the whirlwind blows where the person when he dies, he goes, in the middle of the whirlwind.” (Only the spirit of the person flies up in the whirlwind.)

As historical and conceptual background for Song 10, let us return to the soul's progress in Lowie's (1909b:297) description of Northern Shoshone religious belief. "While rising, they [spirits or souls] look like clouds. At first they are visible only to medicine-men; but, after being washed, any one can see them. Half-way up they are met by a spirit descending on horseback, who then escorts them to their proper place. The mu'gua then becomes a dzò'ap, ghost." Elsewhere, Lowie (1924:297) writes, "A whirlwind is considered a ghost (dzò'ap). When a person dies, a whirlwind is caused thereby."

The whirlwind also has specific symbolic meaning and reference within the broader context of Ghost Dance religious thought, one which parallels traditional Shoshone beliefs.

1 I am coming in sight — Ehe’ ee’ ye’!  
1 I am coming in sight — Ehe’ ee’ ye’!  
1 I bring the whirlwind with me — Ehe’ ee’ ye’!  
1 I bring the whirlwind with me — Ehe’ ee’ ye’!  
That you may see each other —  
That you may see each other. (Mooney 1965:274)

For this Cheyenne text Mooney (1965:274) explains, "The whirlwind is regarded with reverence by all the prairie tribes. In the mythology of the Ghost Dance it seems to be an important factor in assisting the onward progress of the new world
and the spirit army." The text to Song 10, like the above Cheyenne text, envisions the whirlwind as the transporter of the individual spirit. The following Paiute song text bears even closer resemblance to the image and content of Emily's Song 10.

There is dust from the whirlwind from the whirlwind,
There is dust from the whirlwind from the whirlwind,
There is dust from the whirlwind from the whirlwind.
The whirlwind on the mountain,
The whirlwind on the mountain,
The whirlwind on the mountain. (Mooney 1965:292)

Song 10, like Song 3, builds a text through parallel construction. However, the parallels occur between the two sections within each line rather than between the lines, as in Song 3. In line one, the repeated word, deya, whirlwind, marks the parallel construction. Its musical settings create a "dynamic" parallelism through the use of exact and inexact repetitions.

Example 36. Excerpts of Song 10

In line two, the text itself creates dynamic parallelism through the use of inexact rhyme or assonance. The line breaks in two, counter-balancing boi, road, with buhi, green. Finally, note there is also assonance between the two lines of text — yoriendé, havenoré.

Song 2

Damën biyanõ dave-de doih-n-zi
Our mothers day/sun coming out (affectionate, diminutive ending)

havenoré,
lying while moving,

Damën biyanõ dave-de doih-n-zi
Our mothers day/sun coming out (affectionate, diminutive ending)

havenoré.
lying while moving.
Looking around, down for us above coming coming.

Emily: "When our mother comes, when the end of the world — coming, looking for her children. Coming down see, she's above us and looking down and looking for her children. The day, the day, the Judgment Day comes. It's that time. The mothers come, looking down, coming, coming, looking for her children." Dorothy: "Mother Nature." Emily: "When the sun comes up Mother Nature, our Mother comes looking." (We will ultimately return and comment on this second meaning of Song 2.) Emily later expanded on her notion of Judgment Day. "Everybody's coming back. End of the dead, people that's dead coming alive, you know."

Following the progress of the soul, first as a fog (Song 3), then rising in a whirlwind (Song 10), Song 2 suggests that the soul finally takes residence up above, only to return in live corporeal form on Judgment Day.

Let us chronologically present some earlier reports concerning the Wind River Shoshone beliefs on life after death, beginning with Colonel Brackett's reports in 1879. "When an old man is dying he finds himself near the top of a high hill on the Wind River Mountains and, as the breath leaves his body, he reaches the top of it, and there, in front of him, the whole magnificent landscape of eternity is spread out, and the Sun-Father is there to receive him and to do everything in his power to make him happy. . . . The young man after death continues to hunt, while the old man has everything necessary for himself without labor." (1879:330, 331) In 1930, anthropologist Hebard (1930:302) writes, "the Shoshones, like the Hindus, believe in the transmigration of the soul, and that after death they are made over again in the 'abode of our Father, in the land beyond the setting sun."

Mooney (1965:28) describes Ghost Dance beliefs as interpreted by the Wind River Shoshones concerning the end of this world and the beginning of the new. "East of the mountains [Rockies] it is commonly held that a deep sleep will come on the believers, during which the great catastrophe will be accomplished, and the faithful will awake to immortality on a new earth. The Shoshone of Wyoming say this sleep will continue four days and nights, and that on the morning of the fifth day all will open their eyes in a new world where both races [i.e., Native American and Euro-American] will dwell together forever." Shimkin (1947a:331) quotes George Guina's beliefs. "After death, an Indian goes to heaven. God makes him take a bath in a willow basket. The spirit now turns into a person and then goes to a camp, where he ghost-dances. While he dances, he feels good, and God says, 'When they have a dance, they will be glad when they dance.'"

Looking over these older statements one sees that the notions, in Emily's songs, of a spirit life after death and of its return in another corporeal form are not new. The new elements in Song 2 — the concept of a Judgment Day (a safely remote time reference) and the notion of the return of dead people in their original form — are but variations on older themes.
The search by the living world is one of the most common topics running through Ghost Dance songs of the various tribes which Mooney collected (1965:220, 221, 223, 257, 258, 268, 272, 297, 299, 304, 305, 315). Dancers who went into a trance and experienced a happy reunion with dead relatives produced songs which described their experiences. The unique perspective in Emily's Song 2, unlike the songs cited in Mooney, is not that of the living person looking for dead loved ones, but rather of the dead mother who comes back to life and looks for her children.

There is another unique aspect to Song 2 — the existence of two entirely different translations and meanings for the text. Emily: "When the sun comes up Mother Nature, our Mother, comes looking." In Shoshone, dave means both sun and day; therefore, it is possible to interpret dave as a pun, meaning not only Judgment Day but also sun. Damën Biya, our mother, can also be interpreted as a larger cosmological reference to Mother Nature, a correlative to Dämë Apë, our Father, the Creator. The text to Song 2 suggests a close identification of Mother Nature with the sun, looking down from above — coming, coming, day after day. The implied children of this interpretation would be all the living plants and animals on earth. A comparison of the two interpretations of Song 2 reveals that the Ghost Dance doctrine concerning the return of the dead which is present in the first interpretation is significantly absent in the second. It is possible that the two meanings of Song 2 mark a watershed in Naraya belief. Perhaps a void created by loss of faith in return of the dead caused a reinterpretation and restatement of older beliefs concerning the natural world.

Like Song 2, the text of Song 9 also suggests the fate of the spirit after death.

Song 9

_Dämë Apà nanamburë._
Our Father's footprints, tracks,

_Dämën biya namburë nareyǐnôrë._
Our mother's footprints, tracks, making herself rise, fly up.

_Niam biya nareyǐnôrë._
My mother making herself rise, fly up,

_Niam biya nareyǐnôrë._
My mother making herself rise, fly up.

Emily: "Our Father, our mothers, that's when they're gone, when they pass on. ...She's following Our Father, our mother. That means, you know, a person's gone. She's following where Our Father's going. ... Rising up like that — I think that's the spirit. Something like that."

Millie Guina, Emily's sister, passed on to me comments which her husband had made to her before he died concerning the meaning of this song and its
emotional impact. He had told Millie that this was a sad song made up for the ones who were gone. Emily as well as other Shoshone friends and singers do not normally relate and ascribe emotional states to songs; and, therefore, these unusual comments made me return to the text. As I focused on what the text said, I saw more clearly what it did not say. In contrast to Song 2, the text to Song 9 holds no promise that the spirit or person will return. Fathers and mothers pass on to a world above, a one-way passage. Interestingly, Emily reinforced its interpretation from an entirely different viewpoint, that of the spirit of the dead person. Shortly after Dorothy’s death in 1982, Emily made the following comments about Song 9. “It’s a happy song for those kind, where she [Dorothy] is now. The spirits that just leave the world [are] glad to leave this world.”

It is important to remember that during the first two decades of this century death scourged the Shoshone population, reducing it to its lowest ebb of 799 people (Jorgensen 1972:91). I have already pointed out the unusual form of Song 9 which shows influence of Plains musical style (see p. 36). The text also suggests that the song was a late-comer, reflecting grim realities of its time which affected Naraya belief itself.

The Relationship of Naraya Texts to Other Ghost Dance Texts

A comparison of Emily’s Naraya texts with those of other Plains tribes collected by Mooney reveals the absence of several themes which appear, sometimes repeatedly, in the texts of other Plains Ghost Dance songs. One finds no lack of sympathy for non-Indians as expressed in the following Arapaho text.

*He’yo ho! He’yo ho!*
The yellow-hide, the white-skin [man].
I have now put him aside —
I have now put him aside —
I have no more sympathy with him,
I have no more sympathy with him.
*He’yo ho! He’yo ho!* (Mooney 1965:227)

Nor does one find the type of open hostility expressed in the following exchange from an 1890 interview with Kuwapi, the teacher of Ghost Dance doctrine and ceremony among the Yankton Sioux in South Dakota. “Q. How, and who is going to kill the white people? A. The father is going to cause a big cyclone or whirlwind, by which he will have all the white people to perish.” (Mooney 1965:43) In contrast, as quoted earlier (p. 56), Wind River Shoshone belief maintained that when the new world comes, “both races will dwell together forever.” (Mooney 1965:28) This is, in fact, consistent with Wovoka’s message, “He told us not to quarrel or fight or strike each other, or shoot one another; that the whites and Indians were to be all one people.” (Mooney 1965:27).

None of the seventeen texts describe the return of the buffalo and the old nomadic way, recurring themes in Arapaho, Sioux, and Kiowa texts. The following Sioux song texts exemplify this re-creation of Plains life.
Now set up the tipi,
Now set up the tipi.
Around the bottom,
Around the bottom.
Drive in the pegs,
Drive in the pegs.
In the meantime I shall cook,
In the meantime I shall cook.

Now they are about to chase the buffalo,
Now they are about to chase the buffalo.
Grandmother, give me back my bow,
Grandmother, give me back my bow.
The father says so,
The father says so. (Mooney 1965:308, 305)

Texts speak not only of old forms of work but also old forms of play — games and
gambling. Northern Arapahoes, Shoshone neighbors on the Wind River
Reservation since 1878, sang

With the bā qoti wheel I am gambling,
With the bā qoti wheel I am gambling.
With the black mark I win the game
With the black mark I win the game. (Mooney 1965:245)

Why are these themes totally absent in Emily's Naraya songs? Two
explanations come to mind. First, 17 songs might not be a large enough sample to
expose all the topics covered. Second, there is a significant time gap between
the two collections of songs; Mooney collected Ghost Dance songs during fieldtrips
made in 1890-1893, whereas I taped Emily's Naraya songs in 1977-1979, songs
which she learned at Naraya performances of the 1920s and 1930s. However,
other evidence dispels the time gap as an explanation for differences in texts.
Pawnee Ghost Dance songs which Densmore collected in 1919-1921 (Densmore
1972:85, 86) contain references to the old societies from the past and, as late as
1933 Lesser concludes in his study of Pawnee Ghost Dance hand games, "The
revival of Pawnee culture which began to materialize in the years of the the Ghost
Dance went back for its material primarily to three sources in the old culture: the
bundles and bundle rituals, the societies, and the games." (Lesser 1978:106)

Emily's Naraya texts suggest a return to a different past, one of hunting and
gathering by small groups which preceded and then co-existed with equestrian
Plains life. Shoshone migration from a center in southern Idaho and northern Utah
eastward across the Rockies began about 1500 (Shimkin 1940:20). Shoshones
hunted and gathered for 200 years before acquiring the horse and in the process
gleaned intimate knowledge of plants and animals in the environment (Shimkin in
press). Even when buffalo became the staple, large communal hunts alternated
with small group efforts in pursuit of plants and smaller game. From his 1834-1843 experiences as a trapper, Osborne Russell (1965:144) said of the Shoshones that half "live in small detached companies comprising of from two to ten families who subsist upon roots, fish, seeds, and berries."

Because the Wind River Reservation is a fragment of traditional Shoshone territory, it was possible and desirable to pass on the accumulated knowledge of its plants and animals. We gain a glimpse of that knowledge in Shimkin’s article, "Wind River Shoshone Ethnogeography." A few sample entries read, "Thistle (cirsium parryi), eaten in summer; Mariposa lily (Calochortus nuttallii) roots like onion, eaten; Cinquefoil (Potentilla glandulosa) like strawberries, eaten; Giant rye grass (Elymus condensatus presl) for sore eyes; Frickly pear (Opuntia polyacantha haw.) inside burned, for glue and paint." (Shimkin 1947b:272, 273)

The change to reservation life in the late nineteenth century was difficult. It re-ordered Shoshone life and livelihood. Even in the 1920s and 1930s when Emily and other Shoshones performed the Naraya, people eked out a bare subsistence from a combination of sources: cattle, hunting, government rations, vegetable gardens, and gathering of local plants and berries. Emily’s song texts and comments suggest links and continuations with older cultural patterns of foraging and dependence on nature. Gathering and small-scale hunting of pre-horse days, which were temporarily reduced during the Plains period, re-emerged in the new reservation context. During this difficult period of transition when hunger and disease were prevalent, elk meat, home-grown vegetables, and bitterroot soup kept many families going. Shoshones sought survival as they stamped the ground in order to awaken Earth and her nursery of roots. The Wind River Reservation nourishes crops and gardens when watered, sagebrush and grasses when left untended. Like their ancestors centuries earlier, Shoshones once again had to wrest a living from a dry country. It is, therefore, fascinating to note the startling congruence of themes and images in Emily’s Naraya song texts compared with Great Basin, Paiute Ghost Dance songs collected by Mooney. Like the Shoshone texts, the Paiute texts contain images drawn from the world of nature: snow, trees, grass, mountains, rocks, and animals. Texts which refer to the spirit and the return of the dead use images of whirlwind and fog. As there are only nine texts, I shall quote Mooney’s entire collection of Paiute Ghost Dance song texts and invite the reader to see the resemblance of Naraya texts to this older generation of Paiute texts.

The snow lies there — ro’ran’i!
The snow lies there — ro’ran’i!
The snow lies there — ro’ran’i!
The Milky Way lies there,
The Milky Way lies there,
The Milky Way lies there.

* * * * *

A slender antelope, a slender antelope,
A slender antelope, a slender antelope.
He is wallowing upon the ground,
He is wallowing upon the ground,
He is wallowing upon the ground.

* * * *
The black rock, the black rock,
The black rock, the black rock.
The rock is broken, the rock is broken,
The rock is broken, the rock is broken.

* * * *
The wind stirs the willows,
The wind stirs the willows,
The wind stirs the willows.
The wind stirs the grasses,
The wind stirs the grasses,
The wind stirs the grasses.

* * * *
Fog! Fog!
Lightning! Lightning!
Whirlwind! Whirlwind!

* * * *
The whirlwind! The whirlwind!
The whirlwind! The whirlwind!
The snowy earth comes gliding, the snowy earth comes gliding,
The snowy earth comes gliding, the snowy earth comes gliding.

* * * *
There is dust from the whirlwind,
There is dust from the whirlwind,
There is dust from the whirlwind.
The whirlwind on the mountain,
The whirlwind on the mountain,
The whirlwind on the mountain.

* * * *
The rocks are ringing,
The rocks are ringing,
The rocks are ringing.
They are ringing in the mountains,
They are ringing in the mountains,
They are ringing in the mountains.
The cottonwoods are growing tall,
The cottonwoods are growing tall,
The cottonwoods are growing tall.
They are growing tall and verdant,
They are growing tall and verdant,
They are growing tall and verdant. (Mooney 1965:289-292)
Relationship to Contemporary Wind River Shoshone Ceremonies

Like Naraya song texts, contemporary Wind River Shoshone ceremonies also point to the erosion of Plains influence and reference in Shoshone culture. As part of my 1977 graduate fieldwork, I asked people to identify specifically Wind River Shoshone music and ceremonies performed at that time. Everyone identified the Sun Dance, Giveaway Dance, Chokecherry Dance, War Bonnet Dance and Pointing or Forked Stick Dance. Two of the five ceremonies, the War Bonnet Dance, and Pointing Dance, derive from the war-orientation of Plains life and contain war references and meanings. Dancers in the War Bonnet Dance pantomime activities of a war party, finding the enemy and striking the war bonnets, symbols of their foes; finally, the dancers place the war bonnets on women who dance a victory dance. Opportunity was also given for the recounting of war deeds. In its original context this ceremony was performed after successful battles; in the twentieth century it was performed before men left for World War II and more recently at special dances held at Christmas or Easter time (Vander 1978:35, 36). Significant changes had evolved prior to its last performance around 1975. What was originally a victory dance of only women had become a round dance as visiting men from other tribes were invited to dance between each woman in the circle. The leader of this ceremony also commented that it had become increasingly difficult to procure a sufficient number of war bonnets, critical symbol and prerequisite object for a performance. Therefore, the present state and future of the War Bonnet Dance remain in jeopardy.

Like almost all dances and ceremonies of the past, the Pointing Dance has religious and war-like meanings. Its performance gave warriors an opportunity to recount battle experiences. The Pointing or Forked Dance is always fully understood by just one person who, in turn, passes it on to the next generation at his own discretion. Only the selected person learns all of the meaning and movements and thus becomes the principal dancer and caretaker for the dance and ceremony. First, the dancer dances over bolts of cloth spread out on the floor
which are given away during the ceremony. Then he moves to the four cardinal directions, blowing an eagle-bone whistle and pointing a long forked stick at a large soup pot which sits on the floor. The ceremony concludes with a shower of coins tossed out for children to gather and keep (Vander 1978:45, 46). In 1985, the old man who was the last caretaker of this ceremony died without passing his knowledge on to a younger person. The last performance of the Pointing Dance in 1968 was part of the reservation centennial celebration. John Tidzump, descendant of Chief Washakie, "played" chief for the occasion and the Pointing Dance was given in this honor — more akin to historical remembrance than to living, functional ceremony.

While the War Bonnet and Pointing Dances recede from current life, the Sun Dance, which reaches back to the beginning of the nineteenth century, continues to grow in strength and participation (Shimkin 1953:417). Although it too had war meanings in the past, it underwent a marked period of re-orientation during the beginning of the twentieth century. New elements of Christian ideology supplanted older war-centered elements. Sun Dancers no longer abstained from food and water for three or four days in order to gain power in battle, but rather to gain power to cure and heal. Shimkin (1953:474) writes that the modern Sun Dance of this century expressed "the major concerns of the community: cohesion, illness, food, and acquisition of supernatural power." Illness and food, central concerns of the Naraya found expression in its religious contemporary, the modern Sun Dance.

Even the Giveaway Dance has shed its vestige of a male-centered, warring society. In the past, prior to the dispersal of gifts by the honored individual, only male relatives in costume used to dance to the Giveaway Song. Around twenty years ago this changed; female relatives and friends joined the men and danced in a cortège behind the person being honored.

Wind River Shoshone dances and ceremonies which thrive today — the Giveaway Dance, Sun Dance, and Chokecherry Dance — relate Shoshones to the natural world, promoting fruitfulness and abundance.

The Chokecherry Dance is testament to the importance of wild foods which contributed to subsistence in the past and, with reference to chokecherries in particular, is still appreciated and prized in the present. Even this dance and ceremony to a berry, which one older woman refers to as "our sacred food," had traces of war connections in the past. The Chokecherry Dance belonged to the Nose Poke Society, a male society organized in the early 1900s. This society, in part modeled on old Shoshone and Crow societies from the time of intertribal warfare, was, however, essentially a social affiliation. The Chokecherry Dance took place at some of the dances which the Nose Poke Society sponsored. Once again, male dancers for the ceremony had the opportunity to recount war exploits. The Nose Poke Society and other revised male societies of this century have long vanished and Shoshones no longer tell war exploits during a performance of the Chokecherry Dance, but the dance and ceremony endure.

Shoshones gather chokecherries, a small, tart, red berry, and cook it into a sauce or gravy. If chokecherry gravy is to be served with the other refreshments which always accompany social events, and if there are at least four costumed male dancers and some singers who know the Chokecherry Song, Shoshones will
perform the Chokecherry Dance. A large pot of chokecherry gravy sits in the center of the dancing space. Dancers move three times toward and away from the pot, raising their arms in front of them as they reach the pot. After a fourth movement to the pot the dancers circle it with upraised arms, symbolizing both supplication and blessing. The lead dancer then picks up the chokecherry pot and presents it to the four directions. Some older people remember past practices of the dance and its tighter relationship to events in nature, much as Naraya dancers stamped the earth and roots into wakefulness. A ninety-year-old man remembers that the dance was performed in the spring so that the berries would ripen in the fall. A middle-aged woman states that a long time ago the chokecherry gravy used in the dance was thrown out with the belief that then there would be more berries (Vander 1978:39-41).

Today, a flurry of excitement and activity accompanies the ripening harvest of berries on the reservation. Shoshones know the succession of berries as they ripen through the summer and fall: gooseberry, sarisberry, chokecherry, and buffalo berry. The location of berries, not only on the reservation, but also along roads frequently traveled to reservations in neighboring states is still part of the environmental knowledge which many Shoshones possess. Like the Naraya religion of the past, the Chokecherry Dance relates the world of nature to ceremonial dance. But unlike the Naraya religion, performances of the Chokecherry Dance continue to enrich contemporary cultural life.

Naraya Decline

In order to understand the decline of the Naraya it is helpful to review briefly and relate its history to Linton’s concepts and categories of nativistic movements. Fieldwork by Mooney, Lowie, Spier, and later by Shimkin traces Naraya ancestry in forms which go back to at least the 1830s. In this light, the Ghost Dance movement of 1890 provided a strong new charge and reorganized this existent constellation of dance, ceremony, and belief. It also added important new beliefs: the return of the dead, a new earth, and a future life which replicated an aboriginal past. The Ghost Dance of 1890 was a nativistic movement, i.e., it was a conscious attempt to revive or perpetuate certain cultural aspects from the past (Linton 1943:230). According to Linton’s nativistic categories (1943:233), the Ghost Dance movement was a magical nativistic movement infused with strong supernatural, millennial beliefs.

The eventual fall of Wovoka and of the Ghost Dance religion flowed from many sources — unfulfilled prophecies, the tragedy of Wounded Knee, and finally, in 1892, a message by Wovoka telling the tribes to stop dancing (Mooney 1965:158).

The Shoshone Naraya of the 1920s and 1930s, although influenced by the 1890 Ghost Dance, focused more on the perpetuation of older Shoshone ways. Coming closer to the Shoshone Naraya of that time, Linton writes,
Rational perpetuative nativistic movements, on the other hand, find their main function in the maintenance of social solidarity. The elements selected for perpetuation become symbols of the society's existence as a unique entity. They provide the society's members with a fund of common knowledge and experience which is exclusively their own and which sets them off from the members of other societies. (Linton 1943:233)

Naraya religious beliefs and forms ran in an unbroken line to the Shoshone past. They were an expression of Shoshone "existence as a unique entity." Its texts, which evoked the particular Wind River Mountains, plants, and animals, carried intimations and implications of hunting and gathering. It expressed Shoshone beliefs in the efficacy of ceremony to protect and promote health and life processes.

Why did the Naraya decline? Perhaps a sober assessment of early twentieth century events led to disbelief. Sickness was certainly not warded off, but rather the death rate remained the same. An octogenarian on the reservation today explained his lack of faith in the Naraya, noting that as a consequence of a winter performance of the dance, people came down with colds and sickness.

The introduction of irrigation ditches which cut through the reservation land may have, at the same time, severed older ways of affecting weather and relating to the natural world. Irrigation records show that private ditches on North Fork where Emily lives date back to the 1880s. Large irrigation projects, such as Ray Canal, were built in 1909 (Hanna 1916:9, 146). The absolute necessity and dependence on government food rations as a new, settled way of life took shape may have been another factor. Hunting and gathering inevitably became only supplements to agriculture, ranching, government rations, and jobs.

Ironically, it is possible that the strong functional integration of the Naraya contained the seeds of its own dissolution. A comparison with another important Shoshone religion, the Sun Dance, hints at underlying factors which caused the rise of one and the fall of the other. In an attempt to understand the vigor of the Shoshone Sun Dance in this century, Shimkin (1953:435) concludes, "In all cases, there appears to be a correlation between the prior, close functional integration of a ceremony and its psychological rejection at a time of overwhelming crisis. Thus it appears probable that the very feebleness and lack of cohesion of the Wind River Shoshone Sun Dance were important influences in its survival and further adaptation after 1890." Perhaps the historical depth of the Naraya, its Shoshone associations and hardened pathways of thought rendered it inflexible in a time of cataclysmic change. Older patterns gave way to the new cultural syntheses and definitions of reservation life. The Naraya was a casualty of this survival process.

Shoshone leadership and personality conflicts of the time played a role in the decline of the Naraya. Tawunisia, a Shoshone leader hostile to Chief Washakie, was a strong supporter of the Naraya (Shimkin 1942:460). This hostility was perhaps one of the factors which contributed to Washakie's distrust and dislike for the religion. Polly Shoyo suggested to Shimkin other personal slights which fed this dislike. Polly recalled, "They had told everyone to go out, stay out of the tipis, and dance. But Washakie went back to his tipi saying: 'If you had something for me to eat, I would stay. Since you don't, I'll go back to my tent.'" (Shimkin
Skepticism, a dominant Shoshone characteristic (Shimkin 1953:473), reveals itself in a letter which Washakie wrote as late as 1892, in which he asks of a friend, "I want you to write me and tell me what you know about this new profit (sic) that we hear about in the west, and if he is truly a great medicine man, we have heard a great deal about him. The Sioux believe him but we do not know what to think." (Trenholm 1964:297)

There remains one final clue as to Washakie’s skepticism and role in curtailing the Naraya among Wind River Shoshones. In a 1946 interview Reverend Roberts revealed that he too had played a part in this, drawing on his friendship and influence with Chief Washakie to discourage the Naraya (Miller 1959:294).

Beyond Chief Washakie’s lack of conviction or active opposition to the Naraya, other factors as well led to its eventual decline and decay. Mooney cites an event which occurred on the Wind River Reservation in 1890 as one factor in this process.

In the fall of 1890, a dense smoke from forest fires in the mountains drifted down and obscured the air in the lower country to such an extent that horses were lost in the haze. This was regarded by the Indians as an indication of the approach of the great change, and the dance was continued with increased fervor, but at last the atmosphere began to clear and the phenomenon ended as it had begun — in smoke. The dance was kept up, however, without abatement for another year, until the predicted time [for the resurrection of the dead] had come and gone, when the Shoshoni — who seem to share the skeptical nature of their southern kinsmen, the Comanche — concluded that they had been deceived, and abandoned the dance.” (Mooney 1965:52)

Shoshones today offer other explanations. An elderly woman of Emily’s generation remembers asking Johnny Dick, a Naraya leader of past dances, why the religion declined. His response underscored the importance of the music, saying that it was because the young people didn’t know the songs.

Emily has her own explanations. In part, she too blames the younger generation for the abandonment of the Naraya.

These young people nowadays, they don’t know what this Ghost Dance song is. A few years ago they had a dance down there and these young people just, you know, getting blankets and covering their heads up and doing crazy dancing. They quit right there. They give it up.

However, her major explanation for Shoshone loss of faith in the Naraya is, "They’re interested in that Peyote Ceremony." According to Emily, the Peyote religion not only tolled the death knell for the Naraya, but was physically harmful and had brought death to many Shoshones.
When a person's sick in bed, they boil that thing [peyote button] and give them that juice and they just dope them up — get them worse and worse. They can't get well. All these Indians dying off with that.

The introduction and rise of the Peyote religion (or Native American Church as it is commonly called today) was a very important factor in the decline of the Naraya. Chief Washakie's son, Charlie Washakie, was one of the first Shoshones to become interested in the Peyote religion. Casting aside prejudice and hostility, Charlie Washakie socialized with and learned the Peyote religion from the Northern Arapahoes, bitter foes of the past, reservation neighbors since 1878. At this same period when Shoshones sought out new values and institutions, another prominent Shoshone, Moses Tassitsie, visited the Comanche in Oklahoma to learn more about the religion (Stenberg 1946:146). Mooney (1965:159) writes that the important Peyote leader of the Comanches, Quanah Parker, opposed the Ghost Dance and prevented its spread among the Comanches. Later, other Shoshones traveled to Oklahoma to receive Peyote training from the Comanches which perhaps strengthened antipathy towards the Ghost Dance and Naraya (Stenberg 1946:159). Certainly, the disapproval of the Naraya by Chief Washakie in his waning years and the introduction and belief in the Peyote religion by such cultural leaders as Tassitsie and Charlie Washakie exerted important influences on the Naraya and Peyote religions.

As part of a correlation study of religious affiliations in the late 1930s, Shimkin (1953:467) states, "The completely negative correlations between the Ghost Dance and Peyote cult...are functionally real, not merely statistical." The 1980 Shoshone tribal chairman remembers that in the past a prospective bridegroom might be deemed ineligible if he did not share the same Naraya or Peyote persuasion of his prospective in-laws. The mutually exclusive relationship between the Naraya and Peyote religions is exceptional. In varying degrees, most Shoshones adhere to multiple religious systems. Affiliations with Episcopalian or other Christian churches coexist peacefully with belief and participation in the Sun Dance and, for some, the Native American Church as well.

Following age-old naming patterns, Shoshones at first called the Peyote religion, Wóqwedika, Peyote Eaters. There was not immediate acceptance of the new religion; however, early suspicion and disdain for the religion and for the ingestion of peyote eventually gave way to acceptance. In the process the name was changed to the one currently used today, Natsündika, Medicine Eaters. In addition to addressing questions of health, the Peyote religion focused on the psychological well-being and integration of the individual. Its stress on prayer, peace, cooperation, and service garnered inner strength needed to deal with outer challenges of physical and cultural survival.

In the end, after religious belief had vanished, abbreviated performances of Naraya song and dance occurred side by side with other social dances. In the following excerpt from a generalized account of the modern Sun Dance, the Naraya appears in this new context along with other post Sun Dance social activities.
The dancers rest, bathe, and drink during the afternoon following the dance, then go to the public feast in the evening, which is generally on a beef. Social dances, such as the narayar, or Ghost Dance, and the waipénékar, or Women's Dance, may follow. (Shimkin 1953:451)

While attending and studying the 1937 Sun Dance, Shimkin (1953:458) writes, "Incidentally, I also learned that a number of Bannock had put on a Ghost Dance for an hour or so one night of the Sun Dance."

The last dance that anyone today remembers took place in 1959. Emily believes that the Ft. Hall Shoshones and Western Shoshones in Nevada still have Naraya performances. A Shoshone friend whose relative lives on the Ft. Hall reservation reports that some people at Ft. Hall did, in fact, perform the Naraya in 1980.

Such human activities as dance and games can be either religious or social, depending upon the belief of the performers. Lesser's (1978:330,331) comments on the Pawnee hand game apply equally to the Shoshone Naraya.

In the history of the Pawnee hand game we have the transformation of a gambling game into a complex ritual. As the doctrine which called these rituals into being weakens, the rituals tend to relapse once more into mere games.

Constant effort is required to maintain the religious context. After attending a Walapai Ghost Dance, Mooney (1965:59) describes the careful surveillance by three medicine-men who maintained the religious integrity of the dance. "Throughout the performance two or three chiefs or medicine-men were constantly going about on the outside of the circle to preserve order and reprimand any merriment, one of them explaining to the visitors that, as this was a religious ceremony, due solemnity must be observed."

Although Shoshones no longer perform the Naraya, it is important to note that the religious matrix from which it sprang remains vital. Beliefs concerning water, power, health, and nature which shaped the Naraya in the past still influence and inform religious ceremonies and personal lives today. For example, water, a prominent image and concern in Naraya belief, also plays a prominent role in the Sun Dance. The Shoshone name for the Sun Dance, Taguwéné’er, Standing in Thirst, underscores this (Shimkin 1953:418). Abstinence from water is central to the dancer's ordeal and his acquisition of power. When power does come, it is often experienced in a vision involving water. The outer forms may come and go, but not the currents of traditional Shoshone belief, a nourishing source which continues to run below the surface.
Emily's Naraya Faith Today

It seems fitting and appropriate to conclude by returning to Emily and her Naraya belief, giving her the last word on its use and meaning in her life today. Emily: "We always sing those Ghost Dance songs. Our place looks real good. That's what that means. It makes seeds grow." Emily and her sister Dorothy made a tape of themselves singing Naraya songs in 1974. Talking about that tape Dorothy said, "In the wintertime we always have that Ghost Dance songs on. And when something's going through or something's going around [some sickness] we always have that thing on, Ghost Dance song on."

Finally, for Emily, Naraya songs bring peace and relaxation. Emily says, "Sometimes we sing Ghost Dance songs before we go to bed." Naraya songs which recall a harmoniously related Shoshone world of the past, comfort Emily in the present, a prelude and lullaby to sleep.

Emily's Naraya belief is but one strand in the fabric of American Indian religious thought. Vine Deloria, Jr. (1979:299) sums up this broader context: "All things are related. This fundamental premise undergirds all Indian tribal religions and determines the relationships of all parts of creation one to another."
Appendix

Ghost Dance Recordings and Published Musical Transcriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recordings</th>
<th>Number of Songs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Cry from the Earth,</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music of the North American Indians</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Folkways Records FC 7777</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sounds of Indian America,</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plains and Southwest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian House 9501</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library of Congress</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plains: Comanche, Cheyenne, Kiowa, Caddo, Wichita, Pawnee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFS L39</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library of Congress</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Songs of the Pawnee and Northern Ute</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFS L25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library of Congress</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kiowa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAFS L40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library of Congress</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sioux</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFS L40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library of Congress</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Basin: Paiute, Washo, Ute, Bannock, Shoshone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AAFS L38</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
American Indian Soundchief
Pawnee 600

American Indian Soundchief
Ponca 600

American Indian Soundchief
Kiowa 600
Feather Dance Religion (Ghost Dance Religion?)

29 songs

The Library of Congress and the Archives of Traditional Music Folklore Institute of Indiana University house field recordings of other Ghost Dance Songs which have never been released.

Published Musical Transcriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Musical Transcription</th>
<th>Number of Songs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natalie Curtis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Indians' Book</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frances Densmore</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pawnee Music</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Da Capo: New York, 1972, pp. 79-86; (originally published 1929).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Herzog</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Plains Ghost Dance and Great Basin Music&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Anthropologist 37, 1935, pp. 418, 419</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retranscriptions of transcriptions published by Mooney and Curtis</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Mooney</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

33 songs
REFERENCES CITED

Brackett, Colonel Albert G.

Curtis, Natalie.

Deloria, Jr., Vine.

Densmore, Frances.

Hanna,

Hebard, Grace Raymond.

Herzog, George.

Hinton, Leanne.

Hoebel, Adamson E.
Johnson, Thomas Hoect.

Jorgensen, Joseph G.

Lesser, Alexander.

Linton, Ralph.

Lowie, R.H.

McAlester, David P.

Miller, David Humphreys.

Miller, Wick R. and Booth, Curtis G.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title and Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Spier, Leslie.

Stenberg, Molly Peacock.
1946 "The Peyote Culture among Wyoming Indians." University of Wyoming Publications in Science 12, no. 4:89-156.

Steward, Julian H.

Tidzump, Malinda.

Trager, George L.

Trenholm, Virginia Cole, and Carley, Maurine.

Vander, Judith.

Vennum, Jr. Thomas.

Witherspoon, Gary.
SONG TRANSCRIPTIONS

Originally published by UCLA Ethnomusicology
Reprinted here with permission from UCLA Ethnomusicology Department
Transcription Key

\[\uparrow\] No more than one quarter-tone higher than notated.

\[\downarrow\] No more than one quarter-tone lower than notated.

\[\text{Portamento}\]

\[\text{Note released with portamento downward to an indefinite pitch}\]

\[\text{Note released with portamento upward to an indefinite pitch}\]

\[\text{Pulsations on a tone without actually breaking the tone}\]

\[\text{Slight accent}\]

\[\text{Variance of dynamic level}\]

\[\text{Marks the end of a musical section}\]

\[\text{Marks a subdivision within the musical section}\]

\[a, b\] Sections of song

\[a^1, b^1\] Standardized variant forms of a musical section
Brief rest for breath without direct rhythmic significance

$3\frac{3}{8}$th beat, underlying rhythmic organization of threes (or multiples thereof) but not invariable, and with no implied baseline/accord pattern.

$2\frac{5}{4}$th beat, underlying rhythmic organization of twos (or multiples thereof) but not invariable, and with no implied baseline/accord pattern.

Tonic note

Bb throughout the song with no implication of scale or key

Rhythmic representation of the relative total durations of a set of pitches used in a song
SONG 1

Transposed up
one half step

Singers: Emily Hill
Dorothy Tappay

Variations

Pitches
SONG 2

Singers: Emily Hill
Dorothy Tappay

\[= \text{ca. 78}\]

\begin{align*}
\text{Da-} \text{mēn bi-ya-} & \text{nī da-} \text{ve-} \text{de doh-} \text{nī} \text{ha-} \text{ve} \text{nō} \text{rē, Da-} \text{mēn } \text{bi-ya} & \text{nī da-ve-} \text{nī} \\
\text{doh-} & \text{nī} \text{ha-ve} \text{nō} \text{rē. Bui-wai da-} & \text{mē van-dō gema-} \text{nō} \text{rē gema-} & \text{nō} \text{rē, Bui-wai da-} & \text{mē van-dō gema-} \text{nō} \text{rē gema-} \text{nō} \text{rē. no-rē.}
\end{align*}

Variations

Pitches

The pitch lowers by one half step during the course of the song.
SONG 3

Singers: Emily Hill
Dorothy Tappay

\( \text{j. } = \text{ca. 66} \)

\text{Mu-gu-a va-gi-na-ve} \quad \text{Mu-gu-a va-gi-na-ve}, \quad \text{Mu-gu-a va-gi-na-ve}

\text{Mu-gu-a va-gi-na-ve.} \quad \text{Mu-gu-a yi-zi-kan-zi} \quad \text{Mu-gu-a yi-zi-kan-zi,} \quad \text{Mu-gu-a}

\text{yi-zi-kan-zi} \quad \text{mu-gu-a yi-zi-kan-zi.} \quad \text{yi-zi-kan-zi.}

Variations

Pitches
SONG 4

Transposed up one whole step

Singer: Dorothy Tappay

 Variation  Pitches

1)
SONG 5

Singers: Emily Hill
Dorothy Tappay

\[ j = \text{ca. 92} \]


Variations

Pitches
SONG 6A (1977)

Singers: Emily Hill
Dorothy Tappay


Bu-hi ba rõan-zi maru-kan-du ha-ve-no-ře, Bu-hi ba rõan-zi

ma-ru-kan-du ha-ve-no-ře. no-ře.

Variations

Pitches
transposed down one minor third

Singer: Emily Hill

\[ \text{Variations} \]

\[ \text{Pitches} \]
SONG 7

Singer: Emily Hill

J. = ca. 76

Se-na roi-ya-bi se-na roi-ya-ben-de, Se-na roi-ya-bi se-na roi-ya-ben

de. Va-rē-nē wū-mī-nē-ge va-rē-nē wū-mī-nē-ge he, Va-rē-nē

wū-mī-nē-ge va-rē-nē wū-mī-nē-ge he.

Variation Pitches
SONG 9

transposed up one half-step

Singer: Emily Hill

\( J = \text{ca. 90} \)

\( 1 \) \( a \) \( 2 \) \( b \)

\( \text{Dame A-ya na-nam-bu-ru, Dame bi-ya nam-bu-ru} \)

\( x \) \( II \) \( c \) \( x \)

\( \text{nare yizino re Ni-am bi-ya na-re yizino re,} \)

\( x \)

\( \text{Ni-am bi-ya na-re yizino re.} \)

Variations Pitches

\( 1) \) \( 2) \)
SONG 10

transposed up one half-step

Singers: Emily Hill
Dorothy Tappay

\(J = \text{ca. 102}\)

De-ya hũ-kũm-běn-zi de-ya yor-i-en-de, De-ya hũ-kũm-běn-zi

de-ya yor-i-en-de. Boi doi-ya-ra bu-hi ha-ve-no-re, Boi doi-ya-ra bu-hi

Variations

Pitches
SONG 11A (1978)

classical style

Singers: Emily Hill
Dorothy Tappay

\[ J = \text{ca. 98} \]

1) Sai-wai doi-ya-vi sai-wai doi-ya-vi, Sai-wai doi-ya-vi
2) sai-wai doi-ya-vi. Doi-ya dimp-un dimp-van-zing-o-ra dimp-van-zing-o
3) o-ra ce-ne, Doi-ya dimp-un dimp-van-zing-o-ra dimp-van-zing-o o-ra
c-e-ne. c-e-ne.

Variations

Pitches

The pitch lowers one half-step during the course of the song.
SONG 11B (1979)

Singer: Emily Hill

transposed down one whole step

\[ J = \text{ca. 88} \]

\[ \text{Sai-wai doi-ya-vi sai-wai doi-ya-vi Sai-wai doi-ya-vi} \]

\[ \text{sai-wai doi-ya-v} \]

\[ \text{Doi-ya dimp-uhn dimp-uhn muza-re bang-we-nó-ga-re} \]

\[ \text{c-né. Doi-ya dimp-uhn dimp-uhn muzar bang-we-nó-ga-re c-né.} \]

Pitches
SONG 12

Singer: Emily Hill


Tsa pa-ran bangwa-vi no-ra, Tsa pa-ran bangwa-vi nor.

Variations

Pitches
SONG 13

Singer: Dorothy Tappay

\[ \text{\textasteriskcentered} \text{\textasteriskcentered} \]

\[ \text{\textasteriskcentered} \text{\textasteriskcentered} \]

Variations

Pitches
SONG 14A (1978)

Singer: Emily Hill

transposed down one half-step

\[ \text{Variations} \quad \text{Pitches} \]

The pitch lowers one half-step during the course of the song.
SONG 14B (1979)

transposed up
a minor third

Singer: Emily Hill

\( J. = \text{ca. 96} \)

\[ \begin{array}{c}
\text{Da-ka roi-ya se-ya-na, Da-ka roi-ya se-ya-Nó wa-} \\
\text{ró wi-an ni-nó pa-ró wi-an ni-nó e-Nó wa-ró wi-an ni} \\
\text{nó pa-ró wi-an ni-nó e-na.}
\end{array} \]

Variation Pitches
SONG 15

Singer: Dorothy Tappay

transposed up one half-step

Da-më na-voi da-zí-mi doih-in, Da-më na-voi da-zí-mi doih-in

J = ca. 76

Va-gó da-ve wó-gín, Va-gó da-ve wó-gín. Da-zí-

be ga-re-gín, Da-zí-ām-be ga-re-gín. ga-re-gín.

Variations

Pitches

The pitch lowers one whole-step during the course of the song.
SONG 16

Singer: Emily Hill

\[ J = \text{ca. 72} \]

Da-mén doi-ya-vi duan-zi wa-ne-ya, Da-mén doi-ya-vi duan-zi wa-ne-ya.

Da-mén doi-ya-vi duan-zi wa-ne-ya, Da-mén doi-ya-vi duan-zi wa-ne-ya.

Wa-ni-ya wa-ni-ya wa-ne-ya, Wa-ni-ya wa-ni-ya wa-ne-ya, ya.

Variations

Pitches

The pitch lowers one half-step during the course of the song.
SONG 17

Singer: Emily Hill

Huchi nu-wi-ran de-an na-re to-da de-wan e- Na wi-ra-pe-ya nang-an

Na na-re to-da de-wan e-na.

Variations

Pitches